# Integrating Development Education into Adult Education using Active Citizenship as a Focus

## Natasha Bailey

# Acknowledgements

The researcher wishes to acknowledge:

Anne Ryan, NUI Maynooth, for reading the report and

The research Steering Group who gave their invaluable insights and valuable time in regard to the research process and the research report.

# Table of Contents

# Glossary

| | |
|---|---|
| AEO | Adult Education Officers |
| ALO | Adult Literacy Organiser |
| BTEI | Back to Education Initiative |
| CEF | Community Education Facilitator |
| CPD | Continuing Professional Development |
| DEC | Development Education Centre |
| DES | Department of Education and Science |
| EAEA | European Association for the Education of Adults |
| FETAC | Further Education and Training Awards Council |
| IDEA | Irish Development Education Association |
| IVEA | Irish Vocational Education Association |
| LYCS | Lourdes Youth and Community Services |
| NALA | National Adult Literacy Agency |
| NFQ | National Framework of Qualifications |
| VEC | Vocational Education Committees |
| VTOS | Vocational Training and Opportunities Scheme |

# 1 Executive Summary

## 1.1 Overview

This research was commissioned by AONTAS – the National Adult Learning Organisation, in partnership with Irish Aid, the Irish Government's programme of assistance to developing countries. To date, a strategic focus on the integration of development education into adult learning has been missing at both State level and across the development education sector as a whole. Stakeholders in Irish Aid's most recent development education strategy identified this gap.[1]

As the umbrella body for a wide range of adult and community and development education organisations, AONTAS maintains a strategic commitment to promote the role of adult and community education in enabling active citizenship. Both Irish Aid and AONTAS are concerned with coherence between the education they promote and citizenship education. Citizenship education and active citizenship for adults has also been a Government and EU policy priority in recent times.

Since development education can be also be a process for citizenship education it seemed a worthwhile venture to investigate whether or not there would be openness and opportunities to integrate development education into adult and community education using active citizenship as a focus. This supposition is the rationale for the research presented here. The aim of the research was:

*To examine the extent to which development education is understood in the adult and community education sector and to explore how adult educators might be supported in integrating development education into its work and processes using active citizenship as the main focus.*

A quantitative survey, semi-structured interviews with key stakeholders in adult and community and development education, case studies of adult and community education provision and focus groups were used to elicit data that could meet the research objectives. It was also necessary to unpack the contested theoretical terrain concerning the three main practices that were connected in the research, active citizenship, adult and community education and development education. This exploration was done in a context review and informed analysis of the data and the research recommendations.

A summary of the findings, conclusions are presented here in sections titled according to the stated objectives of the research. Finally, recommendations are proposed that emerged from the findings and conclusions.

---

1      Irish Aid. (2007). *Development Education Strategy Plan: promoting Public Engagement for Development.* Government Stationary Office: Dublin.

## *1.2 Findings and Conclusions*

### 1.2.1 Extent of Development Education in the Adult and Community Education Sector

This research found that:

- The survey showed that less than a quarter of adult and community education provision engages in some kind of development education.
- Respondents to the survey indicated that they had little knowledge of the concrete themes that could be explored as part of development education, although they did see it as a process that fostered critical analysis and a focus on global social justice.
- There does not seem to be a strategic focus on the provision of development education in adult and community education. It is ad hoc, depending on organisations' and individual tutors' motivation to provide it.

It concluded that development education is not widely understood or practiced in adult and community education in Ireland confirming stakeholder perceptions in Irish Aid's latest strategic plan on development education. It also concluded that research participants generally did not know about the practical topics or themes that could be explored as part of development education. It will be important that any training or promotion that takes place starts by addressing this lack of knowledge.

### 1.2.2 Understanding of Active Citizenship and its Connections to Development Education in the Adult and Community Education Sector

This research found that:

- The survey showed that many see active citizenship as a process that should also promote critical analysis and social justice as opposed to a 'thin' version of active citizenship which only entails voting and volunteering[2].
- Many research participants indicated that they encouraged their learners to be active citizens and saw this as an appropriate learning outcome for adult and community education.
- Some of the research interviewees understood development education

---

2     The context review sets out this "critical" citizenship as a citizenship based on human rights and responsibilities. It fosters skills for participation for all out of a recognition that some do not have equal opportunities to participate in democracy. It Advocates action for social change whether it is critical of decision-makers or not. It takes the side of those who do not have power.

as only being about individual and community development and not taking a global dimension to learning.

- Participants in the qualitative part of the research did not have a shared definition of active citizenship, development education and adult and community education.

- The qualitative data indicated that there are connections between active citizenship, development education and adult and community education and that active citizenship could be fostered through development education. However, they were clear that other outcomes from development education are also of value to the learner. They were also clear that the actions arising out of development education should not be limited to what they perceived to be a 'thin' State definition of citizenship.

- The outcomes of development education identified by and for adult learners include, learning to learn, research and problem-solving skills, intercultural communication, increased confidence and sense of agency, collective empowerment, critical analysis, leadership and active citizenship amongst others.

The research concluded that:

- There is not a shared understanding of development education and active citizenship within adult and community education and this shared understanding needs to be cultivated.

- There is a general commitment to a critical citizenship from the participants in the research that contests the State's definition of active citizenship.

- Development education has the potential to assist adult and community educators to foster civic competence and active citizenship for learners.

- Development education can also help educators achieve other priorities in learning like literacy skills, intercultural competence, learning to learn and critical analysis.

- Development education can have powerful outcomes for communities. The potential of development education to foster social justice agendas at home as well as abroad is of relevance in community education and adult basic education.

- Development education can have powerful outcomes for individual adult learners. It will be important to promote development education in adult and community education as something that is not just about people overseas, but also as an important process for individuals to learn about themselves and their communities.

### 1.2.3 Comparisons between Development Education and Community Education.

The research found that:

- Development education was perceived to 'fit' best into community education and adult basic education provision.
- The features that research participants said were shared by these three types of provision are Freirean methodologies, flexible provision, learner defined content, community development, critical analysis and individual and collective empowerment.
- The potential of development education to foster social justice agendas at home as much as abroad is also of relevance, particularly in community education and adult basic education.

It was concluded that the AONTAS Community Education Network (CEN) Adult Literacy Organisers (ALOs) and Community Education Facilitators (CEFS)[3] may be the first personnel who could be engaged with in terms of the integration of development education. It is in these more informal spaces that a critical purpose for the three practices can be most easily implemented and development education can be employed, not just to increase participants' awareness of global issues, but to contribute to the realisation of different social justice agendas nationally such as anti-poverty, gender equality and anti-racism and drugs prevention work.

### 1.2.4 Supports, Structures and Resources which could facilitate integration of Development Education into Adult and Community Education

The findings in relation to this research objective were:

- Respondents to the survey indicated that training and materials were the most needed supports to assist them to integrate development education into adult and community education.
- Those interviewed for the research indicated that integrating development education into adult and community education would be a worthwhile venture, albeit requiring a great deal of consultation across the adult and community education sector.
- Arising out of this consultation would emerge a national strategy, implemented by an interagency steering group of key representatives, encompassing a number of key features such as drivers, multipliers,

---

3     The AONTAS Community Education Network is a member group of community education providers who work to promote and lobby for community education. ALO's and CEFs are Vocational Education Committee (VEC) personnel responsible for managing VEC programmes concerned with adult basic and community education.

continuing professional development (CPD), promotion and awareness-raising, champions and pilot projects.

- The qualitative data indicated that development education in adult and community education should not be an add on. It should be integrated across provision through themes and case studies as well as dedicated development education programmes. The data indicated that an argument should be made as to how development education can help educators achieve existing aims.

- Qualitative data showed that the types of programmes and courses that development education could be embedded into are diverse including community development, social studies and social care, personal effectiveness, intercultural studies, politics, history and geography amongst others. There was consensus that development education might not fit into every programme but that providers should look to see where it could fit.

- The multipliers for this integration are VEC personnel professional associations and the IVEA.

- Given the contested theoretical terrains that need to be negotiated in integrating development education into adult and community education, how actions or recommendations are implemented will be just as important as what they are. Criteria for best practice and consensus on definitions of active citizenship, adult and community education and development education will be essential supports to this work.

The research concluded that:

- There is a latent potential in the adult and community education sector to explore the integration of development education since most of the participants in the interviews and focus groups reported that it would be a worthwhile venture.

- Integrating development education into adult and community education in Ireland can happen through existing structures such as the professional associations for key personnel, IDEA and AONTAS. The only new structure required would be an interagency group working at national level to oversee a strategy to integrate development education into adult and community education. Widespread consultation will need to be carried out in all of these fora to support this integration.

- Further development of FETAC modules and awards in development education or global citizenship will have to be supported by a national consortium.

## *1.3 Recommendations*

The following recommendations emerged from this research.

### 1.3.1 Set up a Steering Committee

An interagency steering committee should be set up to oversee a strategy to commence integration of development education into adult and community education and could:

- Consist of the representative organisations identified by the research participants in this report. These included, the IVEA, AONTAS, Irish Aid, CEFA, ALOA, AEOA, IDEA, NALA, DES, FETAC and adult/ community education providers.
- Debate and agree a workable shared purpose of the three practices explored in this research, giving due consideration to the rich overlap presented in the justice/ critical perspective shared by the three.
- Develop best practice criteria for:
    - A strategy to integrate development education into adult and community education, including;
        - any promotion of the integration of development education into adult and community education
        - training programmes for adult and community educators about development education
        - resources and case studies that could be used by adult and community educators to facilitate development education
        - pilot projects that are chosen to test the integration
- Gain agreement that these criteria will inform how participating representative organisations go about carrying out any actions for which they take responsibility in the strategy.
- Discuss whether to feed all, some or none of the recommendations that follow into the strategy and assign responsibility for each action.
- Strive to be a model of participatory democracy.

### 1.3.2 Integrate into Policy and Strategy

Changes in policy will assist work at the grassroots level.

- Lobby the Department of Education and Science to make a policy commitment to integrating development education into adult and community education linked to funding of adult education activities.
- Lobby the Department of Education and Science to fulfil their policy commitments to foster active citizenship in lifelong learning.

- Lobby VECs to present development education to their constituencies as a possible consideration for the next education plan for the VEC area. Approach the CEO or Director of Adult Education in this regard.
- Write a submission to the Task Force on Active Citizenship highlighting the importance of the global dimension of citizenship and critical citizenship based on the research presented in this report.

### 1.3.3 Bring Together and Promote Champions

There are already a number of existing champions who can light the way for others to integrate development education with adult education, such as the D.E.A.L Project, any of the providers explored in the case studies and Comhlamh.

- Bring these champions together to discuss how best to promote the relevance of development education to the constituencies they are from and to learners themselves. For instance, the D.E.A.L project could offer wisdom as to how a VEC could approach the integration of development education into adult education.
- Support more local development education groups to become development education centres, such as those in the UK, that are resources to local providers who want to integrate development education. Those centres could also link those providers to southern organisations, which is an important aspect of development education.

### 1.3.4 Use Multipliers

There are already a number of adult and community education fora that could start a ripple effect in the promotion and relevance of development education.

- Approach the AEOA through the IVEA to offer training in development education. Then, approach CEFA and the ALOA
- Approach the AONTAS Community Education Network (CEN) to explore the possibility of offering training in development education and to see how they could work together to raise the profile of community education and development education.
- Link with PLANET to explore whether or not it would be interested in working to promote the value of development education in education interventions designed and delivered or supported by Education Officers in the area-based partnerships.
- Bring the idea of development education to local fora like the county development boards or area-based partnerships
- Link with the Social Inclusion section in FAS to promote the value of

development education in their Bridging Programmes and Community Training Workshops.

- Support a spokesperson from Irish Aid or an adult and community education champion who is a member of IDEA to make the approaches identified above.

### 1.3.5 Integrate Development Education Awareness/Training into the Continuing Professional Development of Educators

If tutors and facilitators were trained in development education, then adult learners will have the chance to engage in it.

- Lobby third level providers to integrate a development education dimension to their programmes for adult and community educators and to scope progression opportunities for those who wish to become development educators.
- Identify where the responsibility for CPD is held in each VEC around the country and lobby those stakeholders to integrate development education and critical analysis into their training programmes.
- Set up a specific funding line for the CPD of adult and community educators in development education or lobby DES to make CPD funding conditional on the inclusion of development education.
- Support and use members of IDEA to devise and deliver CPD training that includes the 'hot topics' which can be explored as part of development education and takes into account best practice criteria set by the Steering Group.

### 1.3.6 Devise and Disseminate Best Practice Materials and Information

Materials and information will be needed to support this work. There are already many materials available so these should not be ignored. However, gaps should be addressed once they are identified.

- Conduct an audit of all available adult learning materials that consider development education and assess them against best practice criteria.
- Conduct an audit of available FETAC modules or awards on development education or global citizenship and propose modules or awards to fill the gaps identified, including modules focused on key development themes or priorities such as gender, poverty, HIV/AIDS, governance and so on.
- Conduct an audit of all FETAC modules to see which ones development education could fit into.
- Promote best practice materials to their relevant publics, ie LYCS *Connecting Communities* could be disseminated to the CEN and/ or CEFA,

and [www.developmenteducation.ie](http://www.developmenteducation.ie) could be promoted widely to adult and community educators.

- Commission the development of materials and/ or information to address gaps.
- Consider developing a quality assurance system for development education.
- Devise and implement a promotional programme to raise awareness of development education and Irish Aid's work priorities amongst adult and community educators and to promote the funding it provides to support development education.

### 1.3.7 Include Learners

We cannot forget who adult and community education is for in this project.

- Apply for funding for and carry out research about the longitudinal impact of development education on adult learners.
- Ensure representatives on the steering committee named above consult with learners to ask them their interest in pursuing development education topics.
- Ensure a representative of learners is included on the steering committee named above
- Find champion learners and support them to visit learning settings and promote development education.

# ₂ Introduction

This research was commissioned by AONTAS – the National Adult Learning Organisation, in partnership with Irish Aid, the Irish Government's programme of assistance to developing countries.

In 2006, the Government's White Paper on Irish Aid stated that, "Every person in Ireland will have access to educational opportunities to be aware of and understand their rights and responsibilities as global citizens and their potential to effect change for a more just and equal world."[4]

This commitment necessitated a strategic focus on the provision of development education in the context of adult and community education. While there are a number of opportunities for adults to engage in development education in Ireland, to date a strategic focus on adult learning at both State and development education sector as a whole, has been missing.

Stakeholders identified this gap in Irish Aid's most recent strategic plan for development education. To that end Irish Aid set out some key strategic commitments for fostering the provision of development education within adult and community education in Ireland. Those assurances were:

- To explore opportunities for greater support to educators through intermediaries such as AONTAS, and
- To support structured education programmes in community education, prioritising the development of FETAC accredited courses.

Irish Aid also committed to strengthening coherence between development education and national and citizenship education in Ireland. Its core mandate is global poverty reduction by focusing on the issues of gender equality, HIV/AIDS, environmental sustainability and good governance.[5]

Development education is widely understood as an educational process that results in learners taking action towards a just global society. As the national adult learning organisation, AONTAS is concerned with adult and community education's role in promoting active citizenship and democracy. Its most recent strategic plan committed to demonstrating the role of community education in promoting equality and active citizenship.[6] The organisation has also focused on adult and community education's role in facilitating intercultural dialogue, which can be part of a development education process.

---

4        Irish Aid works strategically to promote and fund development education in Ireland see. Irish Aid. (2007). *Development Education Strategy Plan: promoting Public Engagement for Development.* Government Stationary Office: Dublin.

5        See www.irishaid.gov.ie for more information.

6        See AONTAS. (2007). *AONTAS Strategic Plan: 2007-2010.* AONTAS: Dublin.

This synergy between the work of Irish Aid and AONTAS is the rationale for the piece of research presented in this report. The two partners were interested in exploring the following key questions in relation to development education, adult and community education and active citizenship:

- Do adult and community educators and those who support them think that the sector has a role to play in deepening adult learners' engagement with issues of global development, justice or equality?
- Do they think that learning about these issues should result in learners becoming more active citizens and getting involved in volunteering, exercising their vote, protesting, campaigning, community development or other forms of active citizenship?
- How do educators describe the shared purpose of the three practices?
- Do they think that development education as a process for citizenship education is the way to promote the relevance of development education for adults, and
- How could educators be supported to integrate development education into adult and community education?

From March to November 2008 a consultant researcher carried out a piece of national research to obtain the views of a wide group of stakeholders from both the development and adult and community education sectors in regard to these questions.

## 2.1 Aim and Objectives of the Research

The aim of the research was:

*To examine the extent to which development education is understood in the adult and community education sector and to explore how adult educators might be supported in integrating development education into its work and processes using active citizenship as the main focus.*

The research objectives were to:

- Map the current extent of development education in the adult and community education sector.
- Explore what is understood by active citizenship and its connections to development education in the adult and community education sector.
- Draw comparisons between the methodologies and processes of development education and community education.
- Identify possible supports, structures and resources which could assist the adult and community education sector to facilitate the integration of active citizenship and development education into is programmes.
- Develop clear and targeted recommendations for the support of development education in the adult and community education sector.

- Disseminate the findings of the research.
- Support the organisation of a stakeholder event.

## *2.2 The Report*

This report is intended to clearly and accessibly set out the research narrative for a number of audiences including:

- National policy decision-makers
- The adult and community education sector
- The development education sector
- Interested individuals

The report is also intended as a practical resource for adult and community education providers and those who support them who, on reading of this report, wish to pursue integration of development education into their provision. Appendices in the report present available resources to support that work. The report is also intended for development education organisations whose staff wish to take a strategic focus on the provision of development education for adults by providing them with a brief mapping of the adult and community education sector and its multipliers[7].

The report is presented in the following sections:

- Context Review
- Operational Considerations
- Methodology
- Results
- Case Studies
- Discussion

- Conclusions and Recommendations

---

7       Refers to key stakeholders who can assist a ripple effect in the promotion of the relevance and practice of development education in the adult/community education sector.

# ₃ Context Review

## *3.1 Overview*

This section considers the background information and research necessary to inform the analysis of data collected through the research. It should also support the development of realistic, achievable recommendations from the research for the integration of development education into adult and community education using active citizenship as a main focus.

This section presents the definitions of key concepts explored in the research as well as policy trends that could shape or facilitate the integration of development education into adult/community education. For a detailed breakdown of the relevant policies directing the provision of adult/community education in Ireland and directions they give that relate to the research see Appendix A. Also considered in this chapter are any essential debates in academic literature that helped to elucidate the findings of the research.

This section should also clearly and simply set the context for the research for the reader who is not familiar with some or all of the topics linked in the research.

## *3.2 Contested Terrains – Active Citizenship, Development Education and Adult and Community Education*

For anyone who is new to the practices of active citizenship, development education and adult/ community education they will quickly find that the fundamental purpose and definition of the three are hotly debated. This section aims to present and summarise the most commonly articulated definitions and the key debates in relation to each.

### 3.2.1 Active Citizenship

Active citizenship simply refers to the enactment of citizenship rights and responsibilities. It refers to taking action as a citizen. However, there are different ideas surrounding what skills that capacity should entail, and what physical boundaries one's citizenship relates to.

In Ireland, and at EU level active citizenship is a current goal for decision-makers and many civil society organizations. The Irish Government set up the Taskforce on Active Citizenship in 2006 to make recommendations about fostering "civic spirit and active participation" in Ireland.[8] Fostering

---

8    see www.activecitizen.ie

civic competence and active citizenship are strategic goals for both Irish and European policies on adult education.[9]

The four underlying theories of active citizenship pertinent to this research are[10]:

### Liberal
This way of thinking about active citizenship refers to a legal contract between an individual and the State. In return for legal citizenship[11] to a particular nation and protection of personal freedoms the individual upholds certain responsibilities such as voting, paying taxes, and participating in consultations. The emphasis is on the well-behaved citizen engaging in thin forms of citizenship being left to make personal choices as long as they do not violate the rule of law in their country. It is individualistic.

### Communitarian
Active citizenship in the communitarian sense emphasises the notion of an individual citizen having a responsibility to work towards the collective good of their communities. This responsibility can be realized through volunteering or participating in community activities. However, they act within a pre-defined understanding of what a 'good society' is without necessarily questioning it.

### Critical
Critical active citizens recognize that while we have an entitlement to citizenship rights, those rights may not always be upheld for disadvantaged groups in society, and members of those groups may not have access to or have been denied the skills needed to participate in democracy. Therefore, a critical active citizen is concerned with how marginalised groups of people have a differential access to the exercise of power in society. They are concerned with questioning how social, political and economic arrangements maintain these inequalities. Therefore, they may become involved in protesting decision-makers, campaigning, community development and working to ensure those who have unequal status develop and use their voice to protest their inequality and demand that their rights be vindicated.

The three concepts of citizenship described above are not mutually exclusive, but are sometimes critiqued because they depend on the legal status of citizenship. Because of this feature, rights and responsibilities of citizens

---

9 at EU level see Commission of the European Communities.(2005). *Proposal for a Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council on Key Competences for Lifelong Learning.* Brussels. In Ireland see, Government of Ireland. (200X). *White Paper on Lifelong Learning.* Government Stationary Office: Dublin.

10 for discussions of different theories of active citizenship see Task Force on Active Citizenship. (March 2007.) *The Concept of Active Citizenship*. Secretariat of the Taskforce: Dublin. Or Khoo, SM. (2006). "Development Education, citizenship and civic engagement at third level and beyond in the Republic of Ireland." In *Policy and Practice ñ a Development Education Review* Vol 1 Issue 3 Special Issue on Citizenship

11 In other words, the person must have been granted citizenship of a country either through birth or a naturalization process.

can vary from nation to nation. Those inside national boundaries without citizenship may be denied the accordant rights and responsibilities. Moreover, the legal rights protected by citizenship may not ensure protection of universal human rights for all people inside the jurisdiction.[12] In contrast:

### *Cosmopolitan*

Understandings of active citizenship speak to the idea that we are all citizens of the world entitled to those universal human rights articulated in the UN Convention and that we all need to work to ensure that those rights are vindicated for all citizens of the world.[13]

Taken together, the values associated with a critical cosmopolitan citizenship include, solidarity, empathy, respect, social justice and equality.

Each way of thinking about citizenship is informed by a different way of thinking about democracy. In the case of a liberal or communitarian citizenship democracy is about having representatives who you vote for and who you trust or lobby to represent your interests. A critical citizenship is founded on the notion of participatory democracy or a situation where everyone has the right to be heard about what they think the common good is and what decisions should be taken to maintain it.

In Ireland, the global dimension of active citizenship has not been given due consideration by key stakeholders guiding policy development. The Task Force on Active Citizenship Report gives only scant consideration of this feature. The Democracy Commission in their case for democratic renewal in Ireland does not mention the global dimension of citizenship at all[14].

Some say that confining active citizenship to the liberal or communitarian concepts puts us in danger of losing the capacity to be critical about how the human rights of people in our own countries and throughout the world are not equally maintained.[15] Therefore, we play a part in maintaining inequality globally, because we are not critical of the way in which our actions, and those of governments, business and powerful organizations negatively affect others here at home and in other parts of the world.

The liberal and communitarian concepts may not take into account the ways in which citizens in the state and the world may have differential access to the status, feeling and practice of citizenship and that action may need to be taken to rectify this.[16] Within a critical cosmopolitan understanding of

12      Ravazzolo, T. (1995). "Human Rights and Citizenship" in *Teaching for Citizenship in Europe.* Osler et al. (Eds.)

13      Tanner, J. (2007). "Global Citizenship." In *Teaching the Global Dimension: Key Principles and Effective Practice*. Hicks, D. and C. Holden (Eds.) Routledge: London.

14      The Democracy Commission. (2005). *Engaging Citizens' -The Case for Democratic Renewal in Ireland*. TASC: Dublin.

15      Ravazzolo, T. (1995). "Human Rights and Citizenship" in *Teaching for Citizenship in Europe.* Osler et al. (Eds.): 16.

16      Osler, A. (2004). "Citizenship and the Challenge of Global Education" in Kent, A. and A. Morgan (Eds). *The Challenge of the Global Dimension in Education.* Instituto of Education: UK.

active citizenship such actions as protesting and campaigning are seen as essential and necessary forms of active citizenship. Many reflect that within the liberal and communitarian concepts a citizen who is extremely critical of the state is perceived as disobedient.[17]

A critical citizenship is seen by some as essential to combat the pervasiveness of neoliberalism, an ideology that places the market as the organising force for human existence and devalues non-market spheres such as public schools, trade unions and civil society organisations.

Giroux asserts that, in the face of neoliberalism, governments abscond from their obligation to protect the public good and become critical of citizens who demand they maintain that requirement. He contends, "As markets are touted as the driving force for everyday life, big government is disparaged as either incompetent or threatening to individual freedom, suggesting that power should reside in markets and corporations rather than in governments and citizens."[18]

The only solution is to foster a critical citizenry who demand that government reassert a truly democratic society.

### 3.2.1.1    Why bother with active citizenship for adults?

In contrast to a primary and secondary education system in Ireland that provides some citizenship education for children, there is a gap between the institutional commitment to adult citizenship education and actual compliance with that commitment in the day-to-day provision of adult and community education.[19]  It seems that while we are somewhat concerned about children as 'not yet citizens'[20] and making them prime targets for citizenship education we are neglecting adults. Yet much research shows that adults are not enacting even the most basic of their entitlements, such as voting in local and national elections. In and of itself this trend is support for the need to build the capacity for active citizenship through adult and community education.

This need is also borne out in light of what has been called a democratic deficit globally. Naidoo contends that our democracies are no longer democratic

---

17    Khoo, SM. (2006). "Development Education, citizenship and civic engagement at third level and beyond in the Republic of Ireland." In *Policy and Practice ñ a Development Education Review* Vol 1 Issue 3 Special Issue on Citizenship

18    Giroux, H.A. (2004). "Neoliberalism and the Demise of Democracy: Resurrecting Hope in Dark Times." www.dissidentvoice.org.

19    Ceccini, M. (2003). *Active Citizenship, Adult Learning and Active Citizenship, Lifelong Learning and Active Citizenship.* Key Note Speech at the EAEA Conference Cyprus. Also Birzea et. Al. (2004) *All European Study on Policies for Education for Democratic Citizenship.* Council of Europe: www.coe.int.

20    Khoo, SM. (2006). "Development Education, citizenship and civic engagement at third level and beyond in the Republic of Ireland." In *Policy and Practice ñ a Development Education Review* Vol 1 Issue 3 Special Issue on Citizenship

due to the diminishing of local control over decision-making, decrease of trust in governments and vulnerable people not having the skills or sense of entitlement to become involved in participatory democracy.[21]

Research shows that adults would like citizenship education. Ceccini refers to a survey in which nine out of 10 people in Ireland supported the provision of lifelong learning that includes active citizenship.[22] Many academics and policy documents articulate that education for active citizenship involves teaching a form of literacy that is vital for adults in today's world, providing them with social skills that allow them to participate and feel a part of civic life in Ireland.

A question arising out of the need for citizenship education in adult and community education is how do we achieve citizenship learning for adults, in particular, global citizenship education? This question is one grappled with in this research.

### 3.2.1.2  What is the purpose of adult and community education

A key question impacting on the research presented here is how do people understand the fundamental purpose of adult/ community education? Maunsell et al. indicate that there is no master concept of lifelong learning in Ireland and recommend that one is developed.[23] Each competing concept in use impacts on the integration of development education and citizenship education in different ways. The main purposes of adult/community education are set out below.

**Adult education as the development of skills for work** the purpose of adult/community education in this light is purely for the development of workers for the economy. This instrumental view of adult/community education focuses on the development of vocational skills for the workplace. The citizen is understood as worker, consumer and client.

**Adult education as personal development or leisure activities**
individuals joins adult learning opportunities for the development of soft skills or personal enjoyment. This personal development view of adult/ community education focuses on adults returning to learning for personal enjoyment and the development of self-esteem, and well-being. This citizen is an individual whose social capital should be fostered through education.

***Adult education as transformation towards a more equal society***
adults return to learning because they were denied their first chance for

---

21      Naidoo, K. (2005). *Citizenship, Education and Governance in a Global Context.* Speech for AONTAS Citizen Learner Conference.

22      Ceccini, M. (2003). *Active Citizenship, Adult Learning and Active Citizenship, Lifelong Learning and Active Citizenship.* Key Note Speech at the EAEA Conference Cyprus: 9.

23      See, Maunsell, C et al. (2008). *National Report on Lifelong Learning in Ireland.* Educational Disadvantage Centre: Dublin. p 30.

learning due to social and economic disadvantage. In this radical or collective view of education adult learners critically analyse the disadvantage they have experienced and gain the skills and awareness to individually and collectively address their exclusion. Equality, social justice, solidarity and empathy are values associated with this approach. This citizen is educated for meaningful interaction in participatory democracy.

Notably, there are also competing purposes for community education. They are:

***Community education as a service in a community*** provided by a range of providers, but not of the community and solely for individual personal development and empowerment.

***Community education as preparation for community development and social change*** this education grows out of the community's needs and wants. In this way of thinking about community education, provision is firmly entrenched in the principles and practices of community development and is for the critical purpose described in the latter understanding of adult education, employing participative, action-oriented methodologies[24]. AONTAS defines community education as:

*Education and learning which is rooted in a process of empowerment, social justice, change, challenge, respect and collective consciousness. It is within the community and of the community, reflecting the developing needs of individuals and their locale. It builds the capacity of local communities to engage in developing responses to educational and structural disadvantage and to take part in decision-making and policy-formation within the community. It is distinct from general adult education provision, due both to its ethos and to the methodologies it employs.[25]*

Again, these concepts of adult and community education are not mutually exclusive but depending on the emphasis in the policy document or provider ethos each may give priority to different outcomes. Much research has noted a predisposition on the part of European governments to place higher value on adult learning that enables the labour market progression of individuals.[26] When this focus holds sway, certification and measurable learner outcomes and targets in relation to the development of skills for work are prized. Learners are seen as human capital for economic growth.[27]

According to a recent European Association for the Education of Adult (EAEA) report this emphasis emerges from a second generation understanding of the purpose of adult and community education which reverts the notion of learning from a process where the learner is central, to education and training

---

24 AONTAS. (2004). *Community Education.* AONTAS: Dublin.

25 AONTAS. (2000). Community Education: AONTAS Policy Series, Dublin, 2000.

26 For instance, Ceccini, M. (2003). *Active Citizenship, Adult Learning and Active Citizenship, Lifelong Learning and Active Citizenship.* Key Note Speech at the EAEA Conference Cyprus.

27 Faul, M. "Read my lips, it's not just the economy: Reframing Education. *Development Education Journal.* 13(3). 9-12.

where the curriculum is defined according to the system's interests.[28]The opponents of a human capital focus of adult learning emphasise the transformative purpose of adult and community education. The following summarises the key arguments against the instrumental view of adult and community education:

- Important impacts of adult and community education are not just those that are to do with the economy but also those that relate to improvements in personal well-being, the development of solidarity and empathy, intercultural competence and social, cultural and community development, or what is called the development of social capital.[29]

- Provision becomes focused only on the people who can become economic actors so people of the third age, for instance, are left out of the process.

- Non-formal, non-accredited learning is devalued, despite being an important route into second chance education for socially excluded groups.[30]

- A focus on vocational training leaves little space for enabling learners to develop skills for civic participation such as critical analysis or ensuring that people can fully participate in social, cultural and economic systems[31].

- A vocational focus does not acknowledge how education "plays a central role in educating people to deny, challenge, or ignore local and global injustice."[32]

- Education systems can be deeply flawed, reproducing inequality for vulnerable people. If critical analysis and the development of social capital are not fostered then learning settings lose the potential of being sites where learners can analyse and challenge inequality both individually and collectively. In others words, a vocational focus diminishes the potential of education to achieve equality inside and outside the learning setting.

The EAEA argues for a balanced view to the argument and recommends that due focus be given to all the purposes of adult learning saying that an either/ or focus does not serve the learner:

*Economic reality cannot be disregarded, but lifelong learning is also important for the development of democracy, and from a humanistic educational perspective. It addresses the quality of life as well as economic growth.[33]*

---

28      European Association for the Education of Adults (EAEA). (2006). *Adult Education Trends and Issues.* EAEA: Brussels.

29      Faul, M. "Read my lips, it's not just the economy: Reframing Education. *Development Education Journal.* 13(3). 9-12.

30      European Association for the Education of Adults (EAEA). (2006). *Adult Education Trends and Issues.* EAEA: Brussels

31      Lynch, K. (2004). "Equality and Education." In Baker, J. et al. (Eds). *Equality: from Theory to Action.* Palgrave Macmillan: UK. 142.

32      ibid. 144.

33      Ibid. 8.

If this way of seeing education was to be achieved, different outcomes from the education process would need to be valued, acknowledging that a focus on quantitative targets and certification, "are not effective proxies for…or drivers of the desired behaviours that would make a qualitative difference to education."[34]

Giroux also argues against an education system that reduces "agency to the obligations of consumerism"[35] by cutting the connection between education and social change. He asserts that, "democracy necessitates forms of education that provide a new ethic of freedom and a reassertion of collective identity as central preoccupations of a vibrant democratic culture and society."[36]

The question arising in regard to the purpose and provision of adult education in Ireland is how do the possibilities for integrating development education into adult and community education using active citizenship differ depending on the educator's or organisation's understanding of the purpose of adult and community education? Another important question for this research is what do participants think is the purpose of adult and community education in a globalised society influenced by a neoliberal agenda?

### 3.2.2 Development Education

Academics, educators and civil society organisations also debate the purpose and definition of development education. Moreover, the appropriate terminology used to describe the process is also contested. The main ways of describing the purpose of development education can be summarised thus:

- **Development education as a process for ensuring public moral support of a government's or organisation's programme of giving to, usually, Southern or 'Third World' countries for growth or modernisation**[37]
  In this process, individuals learn about the 'problems' of other countries and are asked to give to agencies working in those countries. Typically, in this way of thinking about the purpose learners are asked to give uncritically and may not explore how their own behaviour or their state's

---

34    Faul, M. "Read my lips, it's not just the economy: Reframing Education. *Development Education Journal.* 13(3). 11.

35    Giroux, H.A. (2004). "Neoliberalism and the Demise of Democracy: Resurrecting Hope in Dark Times." www.dissidentvoice.org.

36    ibid.

37    Kenny, M and S. Malley. (2002). *Development Education in Ireland: Challenges and Opportunities for the Future.* Dochas: Dublin. According to Kenny and Malley development education in Ireland emerged as a process to gain support for church and civil society work in other southern countries. Also see Bown, L. (2007). *What do we mean by development?* The Development Education Commission: UK.

actions have impacted on the well-being of people in other nations. People in other countries and the nations themselves may be seen as 'less developed.' Development is seen in terms of human rather than social capital.

- **Development education as a process for raising people's awareness about global issues and to promote campaigns.**
This process may facilitate critical engagement about development issues and motivate individuals to help. However, it does not call them to be critical of the ways in which help is offered and may ask learners to adopt an already defined idea of the good society as opposed to asking them to define it. The above approach and this one are usually described as part of a soft, charity approach, although this process does move the learner to actions beyond donating money.[38]

- **Development education as a process for understanding, how people and countries are interdependent, the global nature of inequality and the development of the skills necessary to enact change to address global social injustices**
In this way of thinking about development education learners are involved in critically analysing why other countries are 'under-developed', as well as how some countries are prevented from developing social capital by our own and our state's actions. It asks us to look at the global nature of poverty and inequality and to consider how human rights are vindicated differentially around the world. It helps learners to develop the skills need to engage in active global citizenship.[39] It also fosters critical thinking about the types of development aid and interventions in existence and to protest those that are seen to be inappropriate.

Again, as with adult and community education, these ways of thinking about development education are not mutually exclusive. In fact, many see that the latter two are historical evolutions of the first. However, Ireland has a strong tradition of giving to church organisations carrying out development work in southern countries that, in the past, operated according to a soft, charity approach. The question for this research is to what extent have adult and community educators and organisations moved from embracing the former to the second and latter purpose of development education?

Today, development education generally aspires to both the process and the content of a set of learning activities towards the latter purpose described above. It also operates out of a clear set of values. There are also many adjectives to describe the process and many other types of education that may touch on development education. The figure below gives a summary of the process, topics, values and adjectives for development education.

---

38      Andreotti, V. (2006). "Soft versus critical global citizenship education," in *Policy and Practice: a Development Education Review.* Issue 3. 40-51.

39      Dochas (the Irish Development Organisation Association), the Irish Development Education Association (IDEA – a membership organisation for development education groups) and Irish Aid all subscribe to this purpose of development education.

## Figure 2.1. Development Education[40]

| Process/ Values | Content | Adjectives |
| --- | --- | --- |
| • Development theory<br>• Freirean methodologies<br>• Experiential, participative learning<br>• Learner-centred – starts where learners are at<br>• Action-oriented for soclal change<br>• Teaches and engages critical social analysis<br>• Rights-based (from International Declaration of Human Rights)<br>• Research and information processing<br>• Debate<br><br>**Works from the Values of:**<br>• Social justice<br>• Equality<br>• Respect<br>• Human dignity<br>• Human rights<br>• Empathy | • Overseas development<br>• Women's issues<br>• Human rights<br>• Health<br>• Environmental issues/ Water<br>• Children<br>• Agriculture<br>• Income generation<br>• Debt<br>• Globalisation<br>• Sustainability<br>• Fair Trade<br>• Racism<br>• Self-reliance<br>• Trade justice<br>• Famine relief<br>• Arms trade<br>• Interdependence<br>• Housing<br>• Land<br>• Asylum seekers/ refugees<br>• Development aid<br>• HIV/ Aids<br>• Conflict resolution<br>• Food security<br>• Interculturalism<br>• Political prisoners | • Global education<br>• Global dimension to learning<br>• Global citizenship education<br>• International education<br>• World studies<br>• Human Development in a Global Context<br>• Education for international understanding[1]<br><br>**Also brought into:**<br>• Political Education<br>• Citizenship Education<br>• Human rights Education<br>• Intercultural Education<br>• Education for Sustainable Development<br>• Environmental Education<br>• Peace Education<br>• Media Studies |

A consideration of the benefits of engaging learners, in particular adult learners, in development education is set out below.

40    Developed from a consideration of all literature consulted for this section. For an interesting discussion of the confluence of all these processes, topics and adjectival educations see, Bourne, J. (2003). "Towards a Theory of Development Education." In *The Development Education Journal*. 10 (30):3-6.

### 3.2.3 What are the overlaps between Adult and Community Education, Active Citizenship and Development Education?

In order to assess the overlaps between the three practices and to investigate to what extent they can have matching purposes the information from the previous sections is synthesised into a description of all three practices under two different philosophical frameworks. Each of the practices can be unpacked from liberal/humanist or justice/critical understanding. See the figure below.

## Figure 2.2 Approaches to Active Citizenship, Adult/ Community Education and Development Education

|  | Liberal/ Humanist | Justice/ Critical |
|---|---|---|
| **Citizenship** | A communitarian approach, individuals should make a contribution to the collective good, ie volunteering. May not critically examine how some do not have equal access to participation in civic life. Focus on obedient citizen. | Critical citizenship based on human rights and responsibilities. Fosters skills for participation for all out of a recognition that some do not have equal opportunities to participate in democracy. Advocates action for social change whether it is critical of decision-makers or not. Takes the side of those who do not have power |
| **Adult & Community Education** | Learner-centred: the learner returns to learning to satisfy personal goals be they the development of hard or soft skills. Current emphasis on development of vocational skills for personal advancement. | Learner and collective-centred employing Freirean methodologies and a concern for radical social change. Fosters learning as a site for analysing and resisting inequality. Fosters critical analysis for social change and individual and collective empowerment |
| **Development Education** | Not uncritical about development processes in other countries or interdependence. Learner asked to take action by supporting existing campaigns. Does not seek to foster citizen's own critical analysis. | Employing Freirean methodologies and human rights, fosters idea that we are interdependent and should play an active role in changing unjust social structures that cause global inequality, poverty and injustice. Fosters critical analysis and skills to take action for a more just world, including campaigning and protest |

What we can see from the above figure is that there is an overlap of purposes between the three practices under each philosophical heading.

In the liberal tradition the overlaps include some attention to the common good and person-centredness and that action should be taken to enhance it. However, there is an individual focus shared by the liberal tradition that focuses on relying on the individual to make personal choices or changes.

In the justice/ critical framework a great deal of overlap can be seen between the three practices in terms of the importance of critical analysis and recognition of inequality. The emphasis is on fundamental social change and a resistance to the status quo. The process shared in adult and community education and development education in this framework is a Freirean methodology that is participative. In this understanding of active citizenship and development education there is an emphasis on taking action to achieve equality and social change. The justice approaches to all three practices share the values of equality, social justice, solidarity, empathy and respect for human rights.

It is in the justice/ critical tradition that we see the impetus for an understanding of development education as education for global citizenship, considered in the next section.

## 3.3 Development Education as Education for Global Citizenship

Increasingly, development organisations and other stakeholders are seeing development education as a process for facilitating active global citizenship. Many large development organisations such as Oxfam and Concern have begun to call development education 'global citizenship education'. The *Maastricht Global Education Declaration* – a strategy for improving and increasing global education to 2015 states:

*Global Education is essential for strengthening public support for spending on development co-operation. All citizens need knowledge and skills to understand, participate in and interact critically with our global society as empowered global citizens. This poses fundamental challenges for all areas of life including education.*[41]

This Europe-wide strategy document positions development education (or global education as it is called here) as a process for creating empowered global citizens. Much of the literature echoes this link, speaking to the effectiveness of development education in fostering the knowledge and skills necessary to be a global citizen:

*Development education has a valuable role to play in contributing to a*

---

41        Europe-Wide Global Education Congress. (2002). *European Strategy Framework for Improving and Increasing Global Education in Europe to the year 2015.* Europe-Wide Global Education Congress: Maastricht see www.globaleducationeurope.net

*new broader, more inclusive understanding of active citizenship, which acknowledges the global responsibilities of individuals and communities.[42]*

There is also acknowledgement within adult education literature that citizenship has a global dimension.[43] Exploring the global dimension to citizenship through development education does not just foster citizens who take action internationally but has the potential to support engagement in the national and local context too, "Development education is a way of helping us to create knowledge about ourselves, and the consequences of our actions. It can help us to understand our own lives in the global context – and to re-evaluate our lives against what is endured/enjoyed elsewhere."[44]

Fincham expresses the link between learning and citizenship and development education's contribution:

*If learning in general encourages people to take a more engaged and informed approach to the issues that confront them then development education can contribute to this agenda, supporting a range of activities that are important for what they teach people to do as they are for the information they impart.*[45]

Many authors agree that the foundation for education towards global citizenship is the universality of human rights expressed by the United Nations.

## 3.4 Why Integrate Development Education into Adult and Community Education?

Very little of the literature is focused on the benefits or necessity of development education for adults and instead describes its role within the primary and secondary curriculum. This section brings together what little could be found and supports the information with some literature focused on the formal education system.[46]

### 3.4.1 Building Essential Skills for Participation in Global Society

The literature is clear that development education can help adult learners

---

42    Osler, A. (1994). "Introduction: the Challenges of Development Education." In Council of Europe. *Development Education: Global Perspectives in the Curriculum.* Cassel:UK. 3-4.

43    Ceccini, M. (2003). *Active Citizenship, Adult Learning and Active Citizenship, Lifelong Learning and Active Citizenship.* Key Note Speech at the EAEA Conference Cyprus.

44    Fincham, G.(2005). "A paving of good intentions: why development education needs to engage with civil society." In *The Development Education Journal.* 12 (1). 4.

45    Ibid. 3.

46    Given that fostering civic participation and citizenship is a goal at EU and Irish policy level for both children and adult learners it is assumed that the benefits are similar for both target groups.

build skills both from the perspective of the development of human capital, but of social capital as well. For some, it is essential that adult educators provide development education, "so that these persons do not become future dysfunctional global citizens."[47]

Some of the skills that can adults can gain from participation in development education include:

- Knowledge about systems and societies that a nation trades with in order to implement fair business behaviour;
- Self-directed learning and problem solving[48];
- Understanding and appreciation of cultural diversity;
- Understanding the global employment market;[49]
- Coping skills for rapid change;
- Social literacy to work with others to address global issues;[50]
- Making connections between different contexts and situations;[51]
- Research and debating skills;
- Campaigning and protest;
- Critical analysis of complex social issues – ability to connect single events to systemic arrangements, and
- Making value judgements[52]

Compare this list with the eight key competences that the European Commission directives articulate should be fostered by EU countries in the strategic planning and provision of lifelong learning[53]:

- Communication in the mother tongue;
- Communication in the foreign languages;
- Mathematical competence and basic competences in science and technology;
- Digital competence;
- Learning to learn;
- Interpersonal, intercultural and social competences and civic competence;

---

47    White, R. (2004). "Adult Education and Teilhardian Thought: contextualising Socialisation into Globalisation." In *New Horizons in Adult Education.* 18 (1). 17.

48    Both taken from, Toepfer, B. "Global Education in Adult and Vocational Education – why is it a must in the 21st Century?" in *The Development Education Journal*. 9(2). 15-17.

49    Taken from Scottish Executive. (2003) *Think Global, Act Local: International Education in Communities.* The Stationary Office: Scotland. 12.

50    White, R. (2004). "Adult Education and Teilhardian Thought: contextualising Socialisation into Globalisation." In *New Horizons in Adult Education.* 18 (1). 17.

51    Osler, A. (2004). "Citizenship and the Challenge of Global Education" in Kent, A. and A. Morgan (Eds). *The Challenge of the Global Dimension in Education.* Institute of Education: UK. 26.

52    For these last four competences see, Rost, J. "Competences for Global Learning." In *The Development Education Journal.* 11(1).

53    Commission of the European Communities. (2005). *Proposal for a RECOMMENDATION OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL on key competences for lifelong learning*. Commission of the European Communities: Brussels. 13.

- Entrepreneurship; and
- Cultural expression.

Some of the skills fostered through development education appear to be skills that are deemed a priority in lifelong learning. Namely, learning to learn, interpersonal, intercultural and social competences and civic competences, and cultural expression mirror skills fostered through development education. It is also quite likely that knowledge and skills to navigate a global economy and society can also be a way to foster the competences of entrepreneurship, digital competence and some aspects of mathematical, scientific and technology competences.

As the Commission notes,

*Key competences are those which all individuals need for personal fulfilment and development, active citizenship, social inclusion and employment. By the end of initial education and training young people should have developed the key competences to a level that equips them for adult life, and they should be further developed, maintained and updated as part of lifelong learning.*[54]

In other words, development education can be used to realise the development of competences in lifelong learning provision and could conceivably be used in adult and community education to develop, maintain and update these skills for adults. However, development education as a vehicle to realise skills acquisition as part of a functional approach to education is not the only motivation for integrating it into development education.

### 3.4.2 Awareness of Global Impact of Local Decision-making

It is widely understood that in a globalised world decisions made in local, and national contexts can have ripple effects internationally. As global citizens, individuals and groups should attempt to make responsible decisions and choices that support the realisation of human rights at home and abroad.

Moreover, development education can support community development and community education locally, because it allows communities to more fully understand their own circumstances and how they can be affected by factors nationally and internationally, "International education can be a key contribution to building community capacity, promoting personal and social development… [and can] result in an increase in social capital.*"*[55]

Central to a critical development education is the idea that "development" does not just happen to "others" in "developing countries", but that interdependence is also played out locally and nationally as well, "We as educators may

---

54      Ibid.
55      Scottish Executive. (2003) *Think Global, Act Local: International Education in Communities.* The Stationary Office: Scotland. 10.

also want to remember that that there can be interconnectedness between development (its character and pace) in adjoining villages or in towns and suburbs, or in regions within a nation state (England and Scotland, say) or in wider geographical regions."[56]

Seeing development in this way can also incur a sense of responsibility to be critical of development processes both at home and abroad.

*Only a recognition that we have problems in common with "developing" countries, a humility about every society's failures to live up to its ideals, the sharing of experience, and a willingness to learn from each other, can save the aid relationship from being patronising and can prepare us well to live in a future global society.[57]*

Thus, development education in adult education becomes an essential process for teaching social responsibility and imagining the transformation of an unequal world. When development is seen as about "us" it becomes difficult to maintain a charity approach where western individuals worry about the problems of poor people overseas and instead becomes about how responsibility for injustice is shared.

### 3.4.3 Social Exclusion as a Global Phenomenon

Development education supports an understanding of the global nature of poverty, ill health, educational disadvantage and gender discrimination, to name but a few. It allows individuals and communities, particularly in disadvantaged communities, to look at the similarity of issues they face with people around the world and analyse the systems that have created them, encouraging solidarity and community cohesion:

*Social and economic exclusion are global phenomena and people living in areas of relative social and economic exclusion in both 'North' and 'South' are concerned with similar issues – pollution, crime and fear of crime, land issues, lack of community facilities, [and] housing.[58]*

Recognition of this rationale for using development education to connect communities and assist individuals to understand their own and others' experience of exclusion can be found in the Lourdes Youth and Community Services (LYCS) Resource, *Connecting Communities.[59]* This resource for community groups shows workers how to bring a global dimension to

56    Bown, L. (2007). " What do we mean by Development?" Development Education Commission: UK.

57    Williams, P quoted in Bown, L. (2007). " What do we mean by Development?" Development Education Commission: UK. 18.

58    Najmudin, R. (2004). "The Global Dimension in Neighbourhood Community Work in Britain." in *The Development Education Journal.* 10 (2). 21.

59    McNeill, Helena. (2005). *Connecting Communities: A Practical Guide to using Development Education in Community Settings.* LYCS: Dublin.

community development.

Naidoo contends that social exclusion cannot be tackled without taking a global perspective:

*Experience has shown that, in and of itself, acting locally will not get to the root causes of many social and economic problems – if the real locus of power is global, or regional, such as increasingly for citizens in Europe as the European Union assumes a greater policy-making remit than previously, then there is a need to "think locally and act globally" as well.[60]*

### 3.4.4 Essential for Civil Society

It follows from the discussion on global citizenship, that development education can facilitate individuals and communities to engage in participatory democracy to create a global civil society. The skills that development education builds can help adult learners to become involved in formal or informal networks independent of the State to ensure that their voices count in the way decisions are made and to ensure the public good.

Moreover, for those who are already operating in civil society organisations or groups the Development Education Exchange in Europe Project argues that civil society organisations should be integrating development education into their strategies and activities.[61] Given that many adult and community education providers are civil society organisations this recommendation is relevant to the provision of adult/ and community education.

## 3.5 Adult Educators and Development Education

Obviously, the direct delivery of development education relies on the motivation and skills of individual adult and community educators. No research could be found which articulated the supports that would be needed by them to integrate development education into their facilitation or teaching. However, UK and Irish sources on the needs of teachers in schools in this regard may offer food for thought. The following needs have been highlighted[6263]:

- Awareness of available resources

---

60      Naidoo, K. (2005). *Citizenship, Education and Governance in a Global Context.* Speech for AONTAS Citizen Learner Conference.4.

61      DEEEP, Development Education Exchange in Europe Project. (2007). *The European Consensus on Development: the Contribution of Development Education and Awareness-Raising*. DEEEP: Brussels. 12. See www.deeep.org

62      Davies, L. et al.(2004). *Global Citizenship Education: the Needs of Teachers and Learners*. CIER: University of Birmingham.

63      Fitzgerald, H. (2005). *Development and Intercultural Education: Literature Review.* DICE: Dublin.

- Practical examples
- How to measure outcomes when part of the process involves values and attitudes
- Access to people with specialist knowledge
- In-service education
- Lack of resources, confidence and time to develop processes
- Not being familiar with materials/ ideas
- Support of principals
- Worry about dealing with controversial issues or managing learners' fears
- Facilitating meaningful exploration of the issues

It would seem logical that adult educators would have similar needs. The research presented in this report sought to ascertain if adult educators shared common needs with those who teach children.

## 3.6 Adult Learners and Development Education

One article was found that examined the needs of adult learners in regard to participating in development education. Bergmullar looked at important aspects of global education with people of the third age and said it should:

- Bring in age similar experiences
- Be practical and concrete
- Provide chances for social networking and participating in social life
- Give the opportunity for personal advancement, and
- Ensure that learners can contribute their own skills and experiences in the learning.[64]

As indicated in the section focused on the practice of development education the process aspires to being learner-centred, consulting with them about issues explored and using participative methodologies.

## 3.7 What could Integration mean in Practice?

Since the integration of development education into adult and community education is a new project in Ireland, this section presents some international examples of how other countries have sought to facilitate the widespread incorporation of development education into adult and community education.

There is some integration of development education into primary and secondary education and the youth sector in Ireland. The mechanisms and strategies used to achieve this goal in those sectors is explored in the

---

64    Bergmullar, C. (2005). "Global Education with the Third Age." In *The Development Education Journal.* 12 (1). 21-22.

operational considerations chapter. Other than the need for the integration of development education into adult education identified by stakeholders in the most recent Irish Aid strategy, no research could be found identifying the reasons as to why the State and development NGOs have not had a strategic focus on accessing adult learners up to this point.

### 3.7.1 Germany

In Germany state-funded adult education is provided through Volkhochschulen or adult education centres in local areas. These centres fall under 16 provincial adult education associations. The Deutschen Volkhochschule-Verbandes or the German Adult Education Association represents these associations. This association has an Institute for International Co-operation that provides support to developing countries in setting up adult education and provides in-service training about international, intercultural and sustainable development issues at home and abroad.

Through funding from the Federal Ministry of Economic Co-operation and Development the Institute runs a Global Learning at Adult Education Centres project that includes in-service training and advice on the provision of global learning as well as materials to the adult education associations and centres. Through its work it has the potential to reach 1000 adult education centres around the country.[65]

### 3.7.2 United Kingdom

In the UK there is a network of 45 accredited development education centres (DEC) spread throughout England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. They are all members of the Development Education Association that is, in part, funded by the Department for International Development. The DEA does not dictate what activities the DECs provide, so each one responds to locally-defined needs and may not work with adults, although many do. The DEA has published *Goals for DECs* which set out the guidelines for the operation and set up for DECs and it does accredit the centres.[66]

The UK's strategy for development education is summarised through a document called *Putting the World in World Class Education*. While it mentions adults, for the most part it discusses integrating development education into classrooms for children and young people. Yet, in its funding of the DEA, it gives implicit recognition of the work done by DECs with adults throughout the country. However, a strategic statutory focus that explicitly names the DECs as the actors to integrate development education into adult education is missing.

---

65     see www.iiz-dvv.de.

66     see www.dea.org.uk DEA. (2001). *Goals for DECs.*

### 3.7.3 Scotland

In 2003 the Scottish Government launched its guideline document *Think Global, Act Local: International Education in Communities.*[67] This policy document set out a rationale for the integration of what it called international education into community learning and development which is essentially this Government's way of describing community education.

The guidelines in the document were to be implemented through local Community Learning and Development Partnerships that are groups of representatives from statutory and voluntary organisation who together were to support community learning and development within their local authority area. The document encouraged those partnerships to think about how international education could help them realise their strategic goals as they were developing strategic plans. They were then asked to agree an international education policy, identify outcomes for the work and identify an officer who would support international education. It suggested that the local authority would take on this role.

Each Partnership's consideration of international education for their area was also to devolve to the managers of partner agencies who were asked to ensure clear lines of management for international education. The document also recommended implementing international education as part of all community learning and development provision at diploma and degree levels as well as putting it into the continuous professional development priorities developed by Partnerships.

While no other policy document has superseded this set of guideline, there have been no reviews of the implementation of these recommendations.

### 3.7.4 A note on Finland

Finland has set out policies that make education for democratic citizenship (EDC) compulsory in basic education. The policies guiding this provision are distinct from the rest of educational policy in the country and EDC is referred to in education law.[68] EDC is implemented through compulsory hours dedicated to social studies in vocational centres and these centres are also required to set up student councils.

---

67     Scottish Executive. (2003) *Think Global, Act Local: International Education in Communities.* The Stationary Office: Scotland. 12.

68     Birzea et. Al. (2004) *All European Study on Policies for Education for Democratic Citizenship.* Council of Europe: www.coe.int.

## 3.8 Summary

The following points summarise the key messages from the context review that are compared to the data to see if they resonate in the context of the provision of adult and community education in Ireland:

- Two philosophical themes emerged from differing understandings of the purposes of active citizenship, adult and community education and development education in the literature. However, the justice/critical perspective provides the richest match of values, methods and skills development in terms of individual and collective empowerment.
- There is an EU and national commitment to citizenship education in adult education which has yet to be thoroughly realised in Ireland.
- There is a tension in adult and community education policy at Irish and EU level between a functional purpose for adult and community education and a transformative one.
- There is a general commitment to the idea that there is a global dimension to active citizenship.
- Development education from a justice/critical perspective is an educational process for active global citizenship, because it teaches us that development is about us all and we all have a responsibility to promote equality and social justice.
- Development education can help to realise many of the priority competences for lifelong learning.
- Development education can support the development of a global civil society that can combat social exclusion on a global level.
- Educators do have some clear needs for support to integrate development education, but these needs have only been identified in the formal system and not in adult and community education.
- Little research has been done on the needs of adult learners in development education, but one article points to the need for practical and concrete, age specific and experiential learning that offers opportunities to learn and practice social literacy for personal advancement.
- Four international examples of the integration of development education or citizenship education into adult learning were presented and will be compared to the research data to see if they offer possible strategies for the Irish context.

# 4 Operational Considerations

## 4.1 Overview

In order to present recommendations for the integration of development education into adult and community education it is necessary to give a brief overview of the provision of adult education and of development education in Ireland, including the mechanisms through which they are facilitated and co-ordinated.

This section is intended as an introduction to adult and community education and development education for readers not familiar with one or both of the sectors.    Also presented is a brief summation of the integration of development education in the formal education system and youth sector in Ireland and a comparison of the mechanisms used with similar mechanisms in the provision of adult and community education. In other words, this section aims to present the practical paths for the integration of development education in adult education in Ireland.

## 4.2 Adult Learning in Ireland

In Ireland adult and community education are a vital part of lifelong learning, as underlined by the aforementioned White Paper and the recent *National Skills Strategy*.[69] The sector is diverse and learning opportunities are provided in a number of programmes and settings. A recent report showed that there are at least 141,255 adult learners participating in Department of Education and Science funded adult and community education in Ireland[70]. The section below sets out the range of provision and how it is supported.

### 4.2.1 Adult and Community Education

The bulk of adult and community education funded by the Department of Education and Science is delivered locally as part of the adult education service of the thirty-three (33) Vocational Education Committees (VECs) through the programmes outlined in Table 3.1[712].

---

69        Expert Group on Future's Skills Needs. (2007). *Tomorrow's Skills: Towards a National Skills Strategy.* Dublin.

70        Government of Ireland, Department of Education and Science (DES). (2008). *The Development and State of the Art of Adult Learning and Education in Ireland.* DES: Ireland. This figure only relates to the learning funded by this department. The number is probably higher.

71        [2] See for instance, www.cdvec.ie

## Table 4.1 VEC Programmes

| Learning Programme/ Course | Personnel |
|---|---|
| Adult Literacy Service | Adult Literacy Organisers |
| Vocational Training Opportunities Schemes (VTOS) in core VTOS centres and Further Education Colleges | VTOS Co-ordinators |
| Senior Traveller Training programmes in Senior Traveller Training Centres | Senior Traveller Training Centre Directors |
| Back to Education Initiative (BTEI) courses run by community groups and adult/community education centres (formal strand and community strand) | BTEI Co-ordinators |
| Education Services to Prisons | Prison Education Service Organisers |
| Community education courses | Community Education Facilitators (CEFS) |
| Self-financing day-time and evening courses | Directors of Adult Education and Adult Education Officers (AEOs) |

The Irish Vocational Education Association (IVEA) is the representative body of the VECs and VEC personnel working in adult and community education have formed individual professional associations[72]. The AEOs are key personnel in the management of adult education in the VECs and they would also manage a continuing professional development (CPD) budget for adult education personnel. The ALO's would also perform this function in regard to the provision of adult basic education in their areas.

Key operational plans or structures in VECs include:

---

72    Adult Education Officers Association (AEOA);  Adult Literacy Organisers Association (ALOA); Community Education Facilitators Association (CEFA); National Association of VTOS Co-ordinators (NAVC); Association of Senior Traveller Training Centres

- An education plan devised every three to five years which is a strategic plan for education provision in the VEC area, including adult and community education. The plans are devised using a bottom-up approach and involve consultation with all stakeholders within and outside the VEC.
- Adult education area teams, development teams and/or inter-disciplinary teams to meet the learning needs of adults in a number of VECs. Adult and community education staff includes full-time, part-time and voluntary personnel. Full-time staff is in the minority.

Two civil society organisations, AONTAS and NALA (National Adult Literacy Agency), support the development of adult and community education by lobbying decision-makers, conducting research, building the capacity of those who support provision and providing fora for debate. AONTAS Community Education Network    is a network of community education groups facilitated by AONTAS to lobby, create awareness and raise the profile of community education.

The AONTAS Women's Community Education Quality Assurance Framework describes the vision, goals, principles and practices of women's community education and includes practices relating to development education or global learning.[73] The NALA Evolving Quality Framework for Adult Basic Education guides the quality provision and practice of literacy and numeracy education in Ireland.[74]

### 4.2.2 Adult Training and Other Courses

Adult learning also takes place in a range of other programmes/courses including:

- FÁS labour market training courses in FÁS Training Centres and Bridging Programmes and Community Training Workshops in community settings
- Development Education courses in development education centres

### 4.2.3 Community Education

As indicated in the previous chapter, community education is generally perceived to be a process distinct from adult education provision in Ireland. However, isolating numbers of learners and providers is challenging, because there is no one dedicated funding programme for community education. For instance, ten percent of BTEI funding goes to

73     See AONTAS. (2005). *The Women's Community Education Quality Assurance Framework.* AONTAS: Dublin. The guidelines refer to the need to celebrate International Women's Day, to make connections between the experiences of women in the past and present in Ireland and the experiences of women globally, to make links between women's experiences locally, nationally and transnationally, and to raise the awareness of others about the global issues and challenges faced by women.

74     See www.nala.ie

community education through its community strand, but this figure would not give the total of learners engaged in community education in Ireland. The VEC also has a separate community education budget, but community education groups are not solely funded through this budget either. In 2008, the Irish Government estimated that there were 30,000 learners participating in community education in the State.[75]

Delivery mechanisms relevant to the provision of community education outside of the VECs are:

- **Community Development Programme**
  Under this programme from the Department of Community, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs (DCRGA) 181 groups are provided with monies to be local resource centres, some of which provide community education. They are supported by regional support agencies, also funded under this strand.
- **Community Services Programme**
  This programme is also funded by DCRGA. Funding is given to local groups who simultaneously support local community activity to address disadvantage and provide employment opportunities for members of excluded target groups.
- **Equality for Women Measure**
  This measure is administered by the Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform (DJELR) is the programme under which many women's community education groups have accessed funding.

All three of these programmes are administered by Pobal, ADM Limited.


### 4.2.4 The National Framework of Qualifications (NFQ) and FETAC

Not all adult learning in Ireland is award-bearing, but the learning outcomes of many courses lead to full or partial awards on the National Framework of Qualifications[76] through the Further Education and Training Awards Council (FETAC)[77].

As the national awarding body for further education and training in Ireland, the Further Education and Training Awards Council (FETAC) gives people the opportunity to gain recognition for learning in education or training centres, in the work place and in the community up to Level 6 on the National Framework of Qualifications.  FETAC also validates programmes and monitors and ensures the quality of programmes. The FETAC Quality Assurance Guidelines make no reference to a global dimension to learning

---

75    Government of Ireland, Department of Education and Science (DES). (2008). *The Development and State of the Art of Adult Learning and Education in Ireland.* DES: Ireland. This figure is probably higher

76    this is a framework into which all certified learning in Ireland is set from Level One to Level Ten. These ten levels encompass learning from primary to doctorate level in Ireland.

77    See www.fetac.ie

or to development education.

Awards are achieved through the completion of stand-alone modules or full courses. Each module has its own descriptor validated by FETAC consisting of aims, specific learning outcomes (SLOs), modes of assessment and marking criteria.

Up to recently, organisations could develop locally-developed modules that were validated by FETAC, run locally and could shared with other providers. Many development education and adult and community education providers developed their own modules under this system. The system has now been replaced by the Common Awards System under which applications for new awards and modules must come from a national or regional organisation or consortium of bodies and go through a standard process with FETAC. This new approach has implications for the development of accredited development education modules or awards henceforth.

## 4.2.5 Other Adult Education Planning/Delivery Mechanisms

Other structures in place to guide the delivery of adult and community education include:

- **County/City Development Boards** which consist of statutory, local development, local government and social partner stakeholders who strategically plan for local development and service delivery in cities and counties.  Typically, the VEC is represented on these boards.
- **Local Area-Based Partnerships** work to address social exclusion for disadvantaged groups in their catchment areas. Generally they employ education officers to support education provision.
- **Local Adult Learning Boards** were structures recommended in the White Paper on Lifelong Learning. These are partnership structures with representatives from the community and voluntary sector and statutory agencies in local areas or counties. Only some areas in Ireland have these boards.

## *4.3 Professional Qualifications and Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Adult and Community Educators*

Given that integrating development education into adult and community education would rely on willing and trained educators it is of note to consider the professional development of adult and community educators in Ireland. There are no set professional qualifications for adult and community educators in Ireland, nor is there a State strategy guiding CPD for them. A recent report by the Irish Government in relation to adult learning and education describes it thus:

*In-service support and training is administered by the Department of*

*Education and Science's Teacher Training Unit, the Further Education Support Service and a grant to the VECs is provided towards training in the specific programmes. In addition, support is provided through a number of professional and non-governmental organisations specialising in areas such as literacy and guidance etc.[78],*

The report points to the fact that there are stipulations as to the qualifications various adult education personnel should hold. Adult Literacy Organisers must hold a NALA/ Waterford Institute of Technology Higher Certificate in Arts in Adult Education or equivalent and Adult Education Officers must hold the qualifications required for appointment as post-primary teachers. A number of FETAC Level 6 or higher educational programmes prepare individuals to work in adult education (see Appendix I). The CEFs do have a national training programme to support them to develop capacity for the work they do.

There is no compulsory CPD for adult educators in Ireland. Providing CPD for adult education personnel is complicated by the fact that many are part-time employees or volunteers and, thus, do not have a contractual obligation or financial support to attend CPD.

### 4.3.1 A note on the D.E.A.L Project

In 2008, the County Clare VEC commenced the one-year Development Education in Adult Learning (DEAL) Project, funded by Irish Aid. This project is the first example of a VEC putting in place a project that aims to integrate development education into adult learning throughout the VEC. Its stated aims are to:

- Encourage and support tutors to integrate development education topics into their course materials and lesson plans;
- Design and pilot a module on Global citizenship;
- Raise awareness of development education work in adult education through the project's website.[79]

## 4.4 Development Education in Ireland

A 2002 research report commissioned by Dóchas, the association for development organisations in Ireland, stated that the research had uncovered 253 groups throughout the island providing some kind of development

---

78    Government of Ireland, Department of Education and Science (DES). (2008). *The Development and State of the Art of Adult Learning and Education in Ireland.* DES: Ireland. 27

79    see www.claredeal.ie

education.[80] As with adult and community education the sector is diverse. There are no statutory administrative or co-ordinating organisations for development education although Dochas and the Irish Development Education Association (IDEA) do work to bring stakeholders in the sector together to scope strategic issues, exchange practice and sometimes carry out research. Irish Aid has worked at a strategic level to guide provision, but there is no VEC equivalent for the provision of development education in local areas.

Provision is also supported and carried out by most development organisations linked to Dochas[81], by dedicated development education organisations like One World Centres or Banúlacht and sometimes by local community education groups like the Lourdes Youth and Community Services.[82]

To date, there has been no research to look at the scope of development education provision within adult education in Ireland and the focus has been primarily on supporting or providing development education in schools and youth settings, as opposed to the formal and/or non-formal adult education sector.[83] Hence, the Irish Aid focus on adult education in its most recent strategic plans. Development education organisations have been found to rely heavily on Irish Aid for funding.

As mentioned previously, there are some locally-developed FETAC modules on development education and some modules mainstreamed into the NFQ that integrate development education themes or topics (see Appendix B).

## 4.5 Learning from the Formal Education System and the Youth Sector

### 4.5.1 Primary and Post-Primary Education

Irish Aid takes a strategic focus on the integration of development education into schooling through the training and CPD of teachers and supporting the development of resources for integrating a global dimension in learning in classrooms. Its most recent strategic plan maintained an ongoing commitment to these actions.

Research has been conducted on opportunities to integrate development

---

80    Kenny, M and S. Malley. (2002). *Development Education in Ireland: Challenges and Opportunities for the Future.* Dochas: Dublin.

81    Dochas. (2003). *Dochas Development Education Survey.* Dochas: Ireland.

82    for a list of organisations doing development education go to www.dochas.ie and www.ideaonline.ie.

83    Ibid from the results of a question asking about which groups organisations target.

education at the primary, post-primary and senior cycle levels.[84] There is a general consensus that development education can fit into all subjects in the curriculum as part of whole school development planning.[85] In other words, integration can happen at all levels of the school from management to the classroom. The National Council for Curriculum and Assessment guides the Department of Education and Science (DES) in this integration, although it is not compulsory. Despite this, many development NGOs proactively work with schools to provide resources and train teachers and this work has been more widespread in recent years.

An exhaustive description of all of that work is not possible here. Some examples are listed below:

- Concern operates a schools debates initiative.
- A number of development NGOs, with Irish Aid have collaborated in the provision of www.developmenteducation.ie a dedicated website providing resources for educators.
- Trócaire, Concern and Amnesty International all work with schools and teachers to support provision of development education. In particular, Amnesty collaborates with the Irish National Teacher's Organisation (INTO) to work on a whole-school approach to human rights education.
- It has been identified that development education can help to realise the goals of the Civic, Social and Political Education Syllabus (CSPE) at Junior Certificate level.

Irish Aid also funds the Development and Intercultural Education (DICE) project that aims to support the inclusion of development education as an essential element of teacher education. DICE has worked with the five colleges of education to integrate DICE modules into teacher education. Research into the effectiveness of a teacher education module on development and intercultural education reported that a compulsory global dimension to their training could support teachers to become more knowledgeable about integrating global learning into their classrooms.[86]

## 4.5.2 The Youth Sector

Irish Aid partners the National Youth Council of Ireland (NYCI) to implement a strategy on integrating development education into youth work in Ireland, including the 100 Youthreach Centres nationally. The National Youth Development Education Programme (NYDEP) focuses on giving all young people access to quality development education. NYCI also partners development organisations to run One World Week for young people nationally.

---

84      NCCA. (2006). *A Study of the Opportunities for Development Education at Senior Cycle.* Irish Aid: Dublin.

85      Ibid.

86      Fitzgerald, H. (2007). *Analysis of the Impact of DICE modules on Initial Teacher Education on Student Knowledge and Views of the Global Dimension in Education.* DICE: Dublin.

This strategy involves working with the Youth Affairs section in DES and the VECs to integrate development education into the provision they offer to young people who are no longer in the formal school system. It also involves promoting a view of development education that it is not an add-on to existing provision but can help to achieve the essential goals of youth work, promotion of self-esteem, political education and social education. It also sets young people at the centre promoting their involvement at a strategic level and aiming to explore the potential of a whole organisation approach to integrating development education into youth work.

NYDEP provides the following services to the youth work sector:

- Training for youth workers
- Resource development
- Programme support
- Information sharing and best practice
- Co-ordination of One World Week and Intercultural and Anti-Racism Week
- Research

## 4.6 Summary

There are operational mechanisms that have facilitated the integration of development education into the formal education and youth sectors that are mirrored in the adult and community education sector. For instance, key personnel in the adult and community education sector have formed professional associations that could be lobbied to ensure their buy-in and input into the integration of development education.

As with the youth sector, there are inter-departmental teams within adult and community education that work to identify and meet the needs of adult learners within the VECs. As with the schools, there are also different sites in which curriculum development is happening within adult and community education. In particular, FETAC is focused on validating the curriculum of accredited learning for awards at Levels 1 - 6 and quality assuring providers. All of these mechanisms represent avenues that could be explored for their potential to enable the integration of development education into adult education.

There are also a number of other fora and processes that have been identified as potential sites where discussions could take a place about integrating a global dimension to learning for adults. These include area-based partnerships, county/ city development boards, local adult learning boards (where they exist) and discussions about quality assurance of adult basic education.

# 5 Methodology

A mixed method 'real world' approach was taken to achieving the aim and objectives set for the research. This mixed motive common-sense approach is described by Robson who says that "the basic claim is that principled enquiry can be of help in the office… or wherever and in initiating sensible change and development."[87] Since this research was ultimately concerned with finding out changes and developments that would need to take place in adult education in order to integrate development education such an approach seemed logical.

The research attempted to glean data in relation to the project objectives at four system levels – policy (or strategic level), organisation, tutor/ facilitator and learner. Existing and potential supports to integrate development education in order to foster active citizenship in adult/ community education were to be scoped at each level.

In order to do this a mix of qualitative and quantitative approaches were employed including a Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) method[88]. The system levels explored through the research and their corresponding methods and samples are set out below.

## 5.1 Research Methods

The table below details the levels at which data was collected and the methods used to do so. Each method is then further detailed as is the sampling strategy for each.

| Level | Methods |
|---|---|
| **Policy / Strategic** | • One-to-one semi-structured interviews |
| **Organisation** | • Survey questionnaire to map the extent of development education in the adult/ community education sector<br>• Focus groups<br>• Case studies |
| **Tutor/ Facilitator** | • Focus groups |
| **Learners** | • Focus group |

---

87      Robson, C. (2002). *Real World Research*. 10.

88      PLA can be described as "a growing family of approaches and methods [that] enable local people to share, enhance and analyse their knowledge of life and conditions, to plan and to act" see Chambers, R. (1994). Participatory Rural Appraisal: Challenges, Potentials and Paradigm. *World Development:* 22(10):1437-54.

### 5.1.1 Desk Research

A literature review was carried out in order to elucidate any literature linking the three core practices explored through the research together and to understand best practice in development education and global citizenship education. A search was carried out for journal articles, academic texts and policy reports using such search terms as:

- Development education and adult education
- Global education and adult education
- Global citizenship education
- Global learning for adults
- Adult education current trends
- Development education policy
- Development education and schools
- Active citizenship and adult education

### 5.1.2 One-to-One Semi-structured Interviews

Twenty-four interviews were held with representatives of adult/ community education and development education who were asked for their reflections about what would need to happen at policy or at the strategic level to integrate development education into adult education using active citizenship as a focus (see Appendix C for the list of interviewees). An initial list of around 15 potential interviewees was drawn up by the researcher and approved by the research steering group. More than 15 were carried out in order to facilitate triangulation and validity of the research when it proved difficult to carry out some of the focus groups for the research. A snowball strategy was employed to identify other representatives whose views would benefit the study.

An interview schedule was drawn up for the interviews, approved by the research steering group and piloted with an interviewee (see Appendix D). Some were carried out face-to-face while others were over the telephone.

### 5.1.3 Web and Paper-Based Survey

A survey questionnaire of 21 closed questions and one open-ended questin was sent to 1018 individuals representing adult/ community education provision in Ireland in order to elucidate quantitative data for the research. The survey was both web[89] and paper-based. For this study, we chose to

89    The advantages of a web-based survey include a faster response rate; easier to send reminders to participants; easier to process data, since responses could be downloaded to a spreadsheet, data analysis package, or a database; the option of putting questions in random order; the ability to make complex skip pattern questions easier to follow; the inclusion of pop-up instructions for selected questions; and, the use of drop-down boxes.

use a software and web space provided by Survey Monkey[90] for very simple reasons: the survey software is easy-to-use, offers a wide selection of questions and answers formats as well as a number of different files formats to export data (notably .xls and .csv –transferable after minor changes to SPSS-) and is cost effective. An IP address filter permitted respondents to fill in the survey only once.

As not all of the sample of respondents had e-mail addresses the research team decided to distribute a paper-based questionnaire to these organisations. A self-completion questionnaire was used to conduct the survey. An email was sent to the sample containing both the cover letter and a link to the survey and a hard-copy with same was forwarded to those who received the paper-based survey.

A survey questionnaire was developed and piloted with ten respondents. Questions asked fell into four domains:

- Understanding of development education and active citizenship
- Approach to adult education and links between development education and active citizenship
- Mapping development education provision
- Supports and challenges to integrating development education into adult education

Respondents were also asked if they felt their organisation could be a possible case study for the research. Respondents were given a certain amount of time to complete the survey. The survey questionnaire employed is available in Appendix E.

### 5.1.4 Focus Groups

A total of four focus groups were carried out for this research to elucidate detailed suggestions as to the actions necessary to achieve the integration of development education into adult education. Six had been proposed, but recruiting participants for this method proved challenging. Five focus groups were scheduled and promoted, each one targeting a specific adult education role[91]. In the end only two were role specific and a mix of personnel attended the other.

A structured process was developed for the focus groups with educators and approved by the Steering Group (see Appendix F). It incorporated a PLA method called mapping which was to allow participants to create a visual representation of a strategy. This method was only facilitated with two of

---

90      See www.surveymonkey.com

91      that is, one was scheduled for AEOs, another for CEFs and so on. Attempts to recruit a group of representatives from development education organisations were unsuccessful as were attempts to recruit a group solely comprised of tutors/ facilitators and managers/co-ordinators of adult and community education centres.

the focus groups because the third could only give the researcher a limited amount of time.

An adult literacy and basic education tutor on behalf of the researcher, who forwarded questions to her to ask the group, facilitated a focus group of learners. These questions are also set out in Appendix G.

### 5.1.5 Case Studies

Individuals who felt that their organisations had engaged in activities which could be case studies for the research self-identified themselves through the survey questionnaire. A total of 25 organisations indicated that they could be contacted for a case study. In order to assist selection the research developed criteria that case studies needed to meet and the researcher contacted each organisation to assess if the proposed activities were appropriate for the research. These criteria were devised from an analysis of the literature and the strategic interviews and allowed the researcher to assess if the potential cases were examples of best practice. A total of five organisation's activities were chosen as case studies.

A series of questions were devised to glean data from the organisations so that short case studies could be developed (both these questions and the criteria for selection are available in Appendix G). Questions were answered via telephone interview or from a thorough reading of written materials about the project. Approval for the case studies was obtained from each organisation.

## 5.2 Data Analysis

### 5.2.1 Web and Paper-based Survey

This data was analysed using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) and Survey Monkey.

### 5.2.2 Interviews and Focus Groups

Interviews and focus groups were recorded either through note taking or digital recording and then typed. Data gleaned through both methods was analysed together and subjected to content analysis and thematic analysis. Data matrices were used to group answers to questions together and/ or to categorise data under themes arising out of the literature review.

Since the mapping exercise was not successfully carried out with each

educator focus group no analysis was done of the maps completed in two of the educator focus groups. However, the stakeholders and tasks named for the maps were included in the main body of data collected through these two methods.

### 5.2.3 Case Studies

The cases were written and then analysed separately from the other qualitative data as texts unto themselves. They were also subjected to a thematic analysis.

### *6.1 Profile of Research Participants*

A total of 301 individuals participated in this research either through the survey, one-to-one interviews or focus groups. An additional five organisations assisted in the development of case studies for the research and these will be profiled in the case studies chapter. A brief profile of the participants is set out below.

### 6.1.1 The Survey

A total of 256 respondents out of a possible 1018 filled out the survey about the research giving a response rate of about 25%. A detailed breakdown of the profile of respondents to the web-based survey is set out in Appendix H. A summary profile is set out below:

- The most often identified role of respondents was that of co-ordinator (41%) followed by manager (23.5%) and worker (15.5%)
- Representatives from a wide range of organisations covering 15 different categories responded to the survey. Personnel from the VECs represented the largest group of respondents to the survey (23%) followed by those in the 'other' category[92] (18.3%) and community development projects (16%).
- Of note, is that, of the 28 paper-based surveys returned, half (N=14) were from Adult Literacy Organisers.
- Representatives of 28 counties in Ireland responded to the survey. No-one responded from Down, Derry, Fermanagh or Tyrone. Most of the respondents were in organisations located in Dublin (30.5%) followed by Cork (10.3%) and Kerry (5.2%).
- Twenty-two percent (n=47) of respondents said they are in receipt of funding for development education activities. 77.9% (n=166) of respondents said they are not in receipt of funding for development education activities.

Given that respondents self selected to complete the survey, the response rate is quite high. However, it is likely that the group that responded has some level of interest in the research topic so they may not be representative of the adult and community education sector in Ireland.

---

92    Other types of organisations who took part in this survey included a probation service, a mental health day centre and a local employment service.

### 6.1.2 The One-to-One Interviews

A total of 24 interviews were conducted with representatives across the development education and adult and community education sectors. Key points about the profile of interviewees are indicated below:

- Sixteen interviewees were representatives of the adult and community education sector encompassing community education, adult basic education, VTOS, adult education, workers' education and FAS[93]. Of these one participants was from an organisation that integrated development education across their programmes, one from a national policy representative and another from a national umbrella body for women's groups.
- Eight interviewees were representatives from the development or development education sector. One of these was from a national body representing development education organisations and another was a national policy representative.

### 6.1.3 Focus Groups

Four focus groups were carried out for the research. Their profiles are considered below:

- One focus group consisted of two Community Education Facilitators (CEF)
- The second comprised eight Adult Education Officers (AEO)
- The third was made up of a mixed group of educators, a CEF, two representatives of adult education centres and the co-ordinator of a community education network
- A fourth focus group consisted of seven adult learners from an adult basic literacy and basic education programme, also one of the case studies for the research.

## 6.2 Survey Results

### 6.2.1 Which of the following would you associate with the term 'Development Education'

Respondents were asked to select features that they associated with development education and to rank those that they believed were the top three. The results are set out in the table below.

---

93    Throughout the results section will be called "adult education participants"

## Table 5.1 Features of Development Education

| | |
|---|---|
| Social Justice | 88.5% |
| Fair Trade | 61.5% |
| Critical Reflection | 72.6% |
| World-wide poverty | 65.5% |
| Fighting for global equality | 71.4% |
| International development priorities | 56.3% |
| Learning about human rights | 81.3% |
| Sustainable human development | 77.0% |
| Donating to a charity | 21.8% |
| Governance | 46.8% |
| Gender | 52.8% |
| People fighting exclusion at a local, national and/or global level | 86.5% |
| Learning process about the unequal world we live in | 77.0% |
| Global issues | 67.5% |
| Migration | 53.2% |
| Food security | 47.2% |
| Emergencies | 33.7% |
| Social analysis | 74.2% |
| Training | 65.9% |
| Empowerment | 82.9% |
| HIV/AIDS | 45.2% |

Respondents were asked to rank from the above list what they felt the top three priority features of development education were. The top priority according to respondents was social justice (27.8% N=70). The second priority was empowerment (13.5% n=34) and the third priority was also empowerment (13.1% n=33).

## 6.2.2    Which of the following would you associate with the term 'Active Citizenship'

Respondents were also asked to go through the same process in terms of the practice if active citizenship.

### Table 5.2 Features of Active Citizenship

| | |
|---|---|
| Exercising legally protected rights | 68.3% |
| **Voting in local and/or national elections** | **89.7%** |
| Paying taxes | 51.6% |
| Participating in the labour force | 42.9% |
| Volunteering in or donating to a local or national non-profit organisation | 63.5% |
| Carrying out responsibilities as a citizen in Ireland set out by Government | 58.7% |
| Working through elected representatives towards shared goals | 54.0% |
| Civil society | 71.8% |
| Working with other citizens towards shared goals | 86.5% |
| **Participating in Community development** | **89.7%** |
| Fighting for the rights of others less well off locally and/or nationally | 83.7% |

The top three priority features of active citizenship according to respondents were, in order of priority; one, voting in local and/or national elections (21.0% n=53); two, working with other citizens towards shared goals (20.6% n=52), and three, participating in community development (19.4% 21.4% n=49).

## 6.2.3    Attitudes towards Development Education, Active Citizenship and Adult Education

A series of attitudinal statements sought to elicit whether or not the educators who completed the survey saw the three practices from the critical perspective outlined in the context review. The statements also sought to understand to what extent the three practices are perceived as linked by the respondents. The table below shows how they completed this section of the survey.

## Table 5.3 Attitudes towards Development Education, Active Citizenship and Adult Education

| | Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither agree or Disagree | Disagree | Disagree strongly |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| It is important to work with other organisations to achieve a civil society | **66.7%** | 29.3% | 3.6% | 0.4% | 0.0% |
| My organisation has a role in encouraging learners to become active citizens | **66.3%** | 30.9% | 1.6% | 1.2% | 0.0% |
| I see connections between the social issues tackled by my organisation here in Ireland and those tackled by similar organisations in other parts of the world | **47.6%** | 41.1% | 10.1% | 1.2% | 0.0% |
| Adult/community education should assist learners to become critically reflective of the society and the world they live in | **73.7%** | 22.3% | 3.2% | 0.8% | 0.0% |
| Practicing development education in adult/ community education should result in learners becoming active citizens at local, national or global level | **51.2%** | 39.3% | 9.4% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| Participation in adult/ community education and development education can empower those who are discriminated against in Irish society | **68.0%** | 28.3% | 3.7% | 0.0% | 0.0% |

The results of this question show that the majority of the respondents connect the practices of development education, active citizenship and adult education within a justice or critical perspective and that their organisations are part of a global civil society that have a responsibility to foster civic competence in adult learners.

### 6.2.4    Mapping Development Education Provision

The survey asked respondents to indicate the types of activities they support or run in regard to active citizenship and development education as well as the hoped for outcomes from development education. Two hundred and five respondents indicated the type of development activities respondents are engaged in.

### Table 5.4 Development Education Activities engaged in by Respondents

| | |
|---|---|
| Provision of development education courses | 53.8% |
| Provision of development education modules within courses | 46.2% |
| Stand-alone development education workshops | 35.5% |
| **Use of materials (posters, leaflets and newspaper articles) about international human rights tools or global issues to assist learning** | **65.0%** |
| None of the above | 12.4% |

Respondents were also asked if they encourage their learners to vote or volunteer. In response, 87.6% (n=205) respondents said they encourage their learners to volunteer and 12.4% (n=29) respondents said they do not. Eighty-three percent of (n=195) respondents encourage their learners to vote while 16.7% (n=39) said they do not.

The survey sought to ascertain if educators saw forms of active citizenship as possible outcomes for development education and what those forms could be from a range of pre-defined responses. Twenty-two respondents skipped this question. The results are set out in the table below.

## Table 5.5 Possible Outcomes for Learners in Development Education

| | |
|---|---|
| Voting in local and national elections as a possible outcome for learners | 69.7% |
| Volunteering for a charity or voluntary group as a possible outcome for learners | 57.3% |
| **Participating in community development activities in their community** | **86.3%** |
| Donating regularly to a development organisation | 14.5% |
| Participating in action at local, national or global level to combat poverty and social exclusion | 70.9% |
| Buying Fair Trade goods | 48.3% |
| Signing petitions to support lobbying campaigns | 55.1% |
| Other | 17.5% |

The main theme that emerged from respondents who specified other possible outcomes for learners was raising awareness around local, national and/or global issues.

Respondents were also asked to indicate if they ran or supported the international events set out in the table below.

## Table 5.6 Events Run/ Supported by Respondents

| | |
|---|---|
| World Aids Day | 11.9% |
| International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination | 30.0% |
| United Nations Millennium Development Goals | 7.9% |
| **International Women's Day** | **56.8%** |
| Gay Pride | 7.0% |
| Human rights Day | 26.4% |
| World Day for the eradication of poverty | 18.5% |
| International day for the elimination of violence against women | 27.3% |
| 16 Days of Action against violence against women | 29.5% |
| World Food Day | 5.7% |
| Fair Trade Fortnight | 23.8% |
| One World Week | 13.7% |
| None of the above | 22.9% |
| Other | 13.7% |

Other activities that organisations support include International Literacy day, Africa day and Adult learners festival/week. About 77% respondents to this question did co-ordinate or support international events.

The survey also sought to elicit whether or not the respondents used well-known development education resources to support their work. The pre-defined list of those resources and the results of that question are considered in Table 5.7.

## Table 5.7 Development Education Resources used by Respondents[94]

| | |
|---|---|
| Partners companion to training for transformation in their organisation | 22.1% |
| Partners companion to training for transformation- Handbook for community workers in their organisation | 26.6% |
| Beijing platform for action | 11.7% |
| 80/20 Educating and Acting for a better world | 14.4% |
| Banulacht's- A facilitator's guide for economic literacy in their organisation | 13.5% |
| One world week theme pack- National Youth Council of Ireland | 14.0% |
| www.developmenteducation.ie | 20.3% |
| 'Connecting communities: A practical guide to using development education in community settings' | 25.7% |
| **None of the above** | **38.7%** |
| Other | 8.6% |

Some respondents specified the KADE library (Kerry Action for Development Education) as a useful resource for their organisation. Also included were resources from AONTAS, the Active Citizenship pack, Trocaire, and FETAC modules such as intercultural studies.

Also mapped were the capacity-building activities that respondents themselves had engaged in, in regard to development education according to a closed list. Those responses are indicated in the table below.

---

94    See the citations for full details about these publications.

## Table 5.8 Respondents own Participation in Development Education Activities

| | |
|---|---|
| Staff/management participation in training or seminars about development education | 50.4% |
| Affiliation to a development education network | 31.6% |
| Staff signing petitions to support international campaigns | 34.2% |
| **Organisation receives a regular newsletter or publication from a development organisation** | **50.9%** |
| staff attending conferences about global issues | 37.6% |
| None of the above | 20.9% |

### 6.2.5 Supports and Challenges to Integrating Development Education

The last section of the survey sought to find out what blocked or had the potential to facilitate respondents from bringing in development education activities into their provision or support thereof. In the table below we can see what challenges people selected as hindering their own provision of development education to adult learners.

## Table 5.9 Challenges to Providing Development Education

| | |
|---|---|
| It is too complicated or complex | 11.1% |
| It is not relevant to my work | 4.9% |
| **Lack of teaching materials and information** | **37.2%** |
| I cannot make a difference to the world we live in through my work | 0.4% |
| Learners would not be interested | 11.1% |
| I do not feel that it is relevant to the education the organisation provides to integrate development education into their adult education provision | 8.8% |
| Lack of support for integration of development education at the management level of the organisation | 18.6% |
| Funding programmes for our work do not allow integration of development education into the work | 34.5% |
| Other | 31.9% |

Other challenges specified by respondents include lack of funding, which

also restricts the resources they have, time constraints, qualified tutors and some learners do not have the literacy skills for the resources that are available (resources need to be accessible to learners).

When queried about the supports they would need to integrate development education into their work or support others to do so respondents indicated the results in the table below.

## Table 5.10 Support Needed to Integrate Development Education

| | |
|---|---|
| Training in development education topics and methodologies | 64.2% |
| More teaching materials and information made easily accessible to me | 63.3% |
| An organisational commitment to integrating development education into what the organisation provides | 42.9% |
| Management guidance and support to integrate development education into our work | 37.2% |
| **More funding for development education activities** | **73.9%** |
| Other | 9.7% |

Respondents would also like more FETAC accredited courses and tutors to be upskilled.

## 6.2.6    Discussion of Survey Results

The survey results present some interesting findings. If the sample who were invited to complete the survey are representative of the total provision of adult and community education in Ireland, then the response rate indicates that about a quarter of those providers were interested in the issues explored through it. Of those, about 205 providers conducted some type of development education with their learners most often through the use of materials about international human rights or global issues. A further 77% (175) providers run or support international events for their learners.

The results show that development education in the adult and community education sector is not widespread. It may also show that, when providers engage in development education they prefer to do so using materials that can be integrated into existing provision or through issue-based events.

The data indicating respondents understanding of development education seems promising in terms of them seeing it from a critical understanding of the process. This formulation is evident from the high scores for terms like 'social justice', 'empowerment' and 'people fighting exclusion at local, national and/ or global level' as well as from the fact that social justice

and empowerment were rated as the top priority features of development education. The results for this question may also indicate that respondents see development processes affecting all of us and that development education is as much about that as it is about what is happening overseas.

What is interesting about respondents' understanding of development education is that they were less likely to choose the practical topics or themes that are explored through development education, like gender, HIV/AIDS and food security. This finding may indicate that the integration of development education into adult and community education is going to need to address educators' lack of awareness of these themes. The results may also show the respondents' lack of awareness of Irish Aid's priority issues.

Of note is the high score for 'learning about human rights' indicating that respondents may see them as the foundation for development education, but also that this is a theme that they, and learners find relevant and engaging.

The data about respondents' understanding of active citizenship seems to show that most respondents embrace a critical citizenship, because they chose voting as often as they selected participating in community development as associated with active citizenship. These two features were also ranked as part of the top three features of active citizenship as well as working with other citizens towards shared goals.

Responses also show that most of the respondents foster civic competence by encouraging their learners to vote and volunteer. Since the scores for these two actions as possible outcomes for development education were not as high as the outcome of participating in community development we cannot be sure that respondents see development education as a process for fostering voting and volunteering.

The attitudinal statements illustrate that most respondents see an overlap between active citizenship, adult education and development education and a critical stance informs their perception of the overlaps.

The relatively low number of respondents using common development education resources and the identified need for training and resources is consistent with the needs identified for school teachers presented in the context review. These findings indicate that adult/ community educators are no different than schoolteachers in this regard.

The data from the survey shows that, for those who responded there is great potential to resource them with training and materials that can enable them to work with learners or support other educators to do issue-based critical development education that can lead to critical citizenship. However, this survey represents a small proportion of adult and community education provision in Ireland. Of note, is the high number of VEC managers and ALOs who completed the survey. This trend that may indicate some possible

multipliers for organisations who wish to strategically focus on integrating development education into adult and community education.

## 6.3 Interview and Focus Group Results

The data collected through the interviews and adult educator focus groups were analysed together as they were asked for similar information[95]. Each focus group represents one case in the analysis.[96] The notes from the interviews and focus groups were collated in relation to what participants said about the following:

- The purpose of adult and community education, active citizenship and development education
- The overlapping or shared purpose of the three practices
- Strategies to achieve the integration
- Stakeholders for integration of development education into adult and community education and the roles and tasks they would perform
- Courses/ learning opportunities into which development education could be integrated
- Outcomes for adult learners who participate in development education

Data collated under these headings was then content analysed to give the following summation of results.

### 6.3.1 Purpose of Adult Education, Active Citizenship and Development Education

Using the theoretical frameworks outlined in the context review, the participants views about the purpose of the three practices were analysed to reveal which theoretical perspective each case seemed to coming from in relation to each one. In other words, the researcher sought to ascertain whether or not each case was coming from a conservative, liberal or justice/ critical understanding of each practice.

#### 6.3.1.1   Purpose of Adult and Community Education

Nineteen of the cases outlined what they felt the purpose of adult education to be. None of these described the purpose of adult and community education solely in terms of a neoliberal or functional understanding. Seven of the adult education interviewees and three of the development education representatives defined a more liberal purpose for adult education. Six of the

---

95      The learner focus group data is considered in the section on outcomes for learners.
96      In other words, a focus group's response would be equal to one.

adult education interviewees identified a critical purpose for adult education and four of the development education representatives did the same.

A liberal understanding of adult education is evident in this quote from a development education participant:

*"Lifelong learning is about recognizing adults as curious people trying to understand and make sense of the world they live in. It is about bringing our life experiences back into the classroom and examining them with our peers, it is about helping us recognise that there are many truths, many ways of being, and many ways of experiencing others in the world."*
**Development Education Participant**

In contrast the following quote from the research highlights the critical understanding of adult education:

*"[Adult education] I think can be both for the individual… to access the labour market, further education or their own personal development.*
*A further purpose is more radical, rooted more in radical traditions; education that has more of a collective purpose based in the work of Paulo Freire. Ireland has a tradition of collective action through co-operatives; and feminism has been very influential in all that collective action for social change at a local level or a wider level"*
**Adult Education Participant**

Many of those who set out a critical understanding of the purpose for adult education differentiated between adult education and community education:

*"Community education is more dynamic, less about skills or practical focus and more about community development and developing the role of community responsibility"* **Development Education Participant**

Four of the cases acknowledged the tension between a national policy focus on adult education for labour market progression and a more transformative approach to adult education.

## 6.3.1.2  Purpose of Development Education

The purpose of development education was gleaned from 24 cases. Three of the adult education interviewees identified development education as a process that was to engender uncritical moral support of the government or a charity's activities for development in other countries. Five of the adult education cases identified that development education was about personal or community development. Of note, is that the latter occurred in the CEF focus group the AEO focus group, and the interviews with the two representatives from FAS. The AEO focus group identified that when development education is referred to in the context of adult education it generally describes the

development of individuals in their communities and not a global dimension to learning.

Six of the adult education interviewees identified a liberal purpose for development education typified by the following quote from an adult education participant:

*"Development education is about raising awareness and understanding of issues in the third world and the possible interaction of what we do on others out there [Its about] being a fulfilling member of society when everything is being internationalised."*
**Adult Education Participant**

In this understanding development education is a process for individual awareness and being a member of a good global society, but does not involve a critical revisioning of the world or campaigning or protest. One development education representative identified a liberal purpose for development education. In contrast, those who described a critical purpose to development education named campaigning and protest as key actions arising from the process. Seven of the development education representatives outlined a critical purpose while four of the adult education representatives' understandings were aligned with this way of thinking about the process:

*"It's about a contribution to a more just and equal world, it's focused on the unequal relationship between north and south. Its primary aim is about understanding that relationship and action for global justice"*
**Development Education Participant**

### 6.3.1.3   The Purpose of Active Citizenship

The purpose of active citizenship was described in 22 cases. Of these four of the adult education cases described a liberal purpose for active citizenship as did one development education representative. A liberal purpose for active citizenship was described thus:

*Active citizenship is about empowering people to engage actively in the social, cultural and economic life of the community and to participate actively in the democratic process (adult education participant).*

In this quote we see evidence of a central tenet in a liberal understanding of active citizenship which, while advocating participation, does not mention taking a critical stance.

Eleven adult education representative's understandings of the purpose of active citizenship fit a critical perspective as did seven of the development education representative's responses.

*"Active citizenship is the activities that stem from that kind of informed and educated citizen member of society its things like a person that is*

*using their voice and an informed person whose using their vote or their membership of a society, or political party or of a union we'll say to influence something on whatever issue it is to make a difference to affect social change. Its recognising injustice or corruption or human rights abuses or whatever, being aware, being informed and aware enough to be able to do something to take action to stand up for something"*
**Development Education Participant**

Eight of the cases analysed critiqued what they described as the State's reductionist definition of active citizenship and in some cases felt the term had been high jacked by the State. As a result, they felt the term was now perceived to only describe voting and volunteering rather than a diverse range of actions.

*"We would be concerned about the Taskforce on Active Citizenship and that definition which emphasises individuals' responsibility to the community and talks about responsibilities and rights. We would say that there are so many rights that aren't vindicated that the Task Force definition.. it leaves out a lot of those dimensions of power and growing inequality in society and in the world.. that view of active citizenship can reduce it to volunteering and voting. They are both important but it depoliticises it in some way. We think it should be much broader.. maybe a critical citizenship or something along those lines"*
**Adult Education Participant**

## 6.3.2 Overlapping Purposes of the Three Practices

None of the cases analysed indicated that there was not a shared purpose for the three practices. However, five of the adult education cases stated that they had not thought about the connection until they participated in the interview or focus group.

For the most part, those who defined the purpose of each of the three practices from the critical perspective always included a reference to action as a shared purpose of the three.

The list below shows how participants describe the shared purposes of the three practices:

- Global citizenship/ global dimension of active citizenship
- Empowering
- Participate/ participation
- Critical/ social analysis
- Methodologies – participant-centred, Freirean
- Enabling people to understand how they can contribute to their community and society here and at home

The table below shows the terms or phrases most often used by the different

sectors represented in the research in relation to the shared purpose of the three practices.

## Figure 5.1 Overlaps between the three Practices

| Adult Education Cases | Development Education Cases |
|---|---|
| • Empowering<br>• Critical thinking/ awareness<br>• Broader understanding of world and how to contribute | • Active citizenship or taking action<br>• Participate<br>• Empowering<br>• Freirean methodologies |

Only one participant from the adult education perspective felt that it would not be relevant to "consciously" link the three practices for adult learners. Seven of the cases indicated that linking the three fostered global citizenship.

*"So if you put the three things together, if development education can awaken people's whole notion that what we do has an impact on people across the globe and we have a role to play in trying to help people to attain a better standard of living through adult/community education then active citizenship flows out of that - the three of them together can rub off each other. You can come to any one first but if you can link all three together and if they can be part of the same equation or the same approach then it is a very powerful force for good"*
**Adult Education Participant**

Six explicitly said that development education could be used to foster active citizenship. An adult education participant said, "You get more of a buy-in to development education if you talk about how it can foster active citizenship."

For most of the development education participants the link between the three practices was very clear, "adult education is a key process for active citizenship, development education provides the global dimension" (development education participant).

Two participants cautioned that it was important to foster active citizenship through adult education starting at the local and national level first and then broadening to the global to encourage relevance and also to ensure that learners approach development education from a critical stance.

However, the link between the three practices was not always described as self-evident. A participant representing adult education describes how current adult education provision impedes this connection:

*"There's a philosophical tie up [between active citizenship, development education and adult education] but adult education has moved away from a clear philosophy and therefore it has reduced the capacity in that*

*process for the person to identify their own personal circumstances and to begin to relate that to global issues or other similar circumstances because adults are tending to come because they specifically want to achieve one thing - its to help the grandson do their maths, its for a very specific purpose in their mind. If they stay long enough they begin to make connections between their life circumstance and the life circumstance of others"* **Adult Education Participant**

Overwhelmingly, the participants in the research said that while Irish people had recently become more critical in regard to issues of global injustice and inequality, the charity model or purpose of development and development education continued to impede a deep engagement with these issues. The media was named almost always as the source of this perspective.

### 6.3.3 Strategies to Integrate Development Education into Adult Education

All but one adult education participant in the interviews and educator focus groups said that adult and community education had a role to facilitate adults' engagement with issues of global justice and equality or development education. For example, a representative of adult education said,

"Yes, there is a role – the role of adult education is to help adults address issues that affect their lives so if it comes up as an issue development education could be done." **Adult Education Participant**

Differences in perspective occurred in relation to what that integration might look like across the entire provision of adult and community education. Eighteen of the cases indicated that integrating development education should involve embedding it into existing courses and programmes or a "look to see where it can fit" approach to integration. There was a consensus that development education would not fit into everything. For instance, an adult education participant said:

*"FAS would be interested in exploring the integration of development education into some of the training we provide. In particular, looking at where it might fit into bridging programmes or community training workshops with some of the specific groups we target with these programmes as a way to encourage civic competence and communication skills. However, it would be a challenge for us to see how we could bring it into the vocational training we provide since it is so skills specific and would mean extending the courses we run"*
**Adult Education Participant**

Many felt that the most effective way to reach adults was to bring it in, in terms of themes or topics into a range of learning opportunities. Some were aware that this was a long-term, aspirational process, but saw it as the most appropriate way to integrate development education into adult education,

*"Rather than establish a separate course/programme to teach 'responsible citizenship', I think we should laterally integrate responsible citizenship (development education) across everything we do - across the whole curriculum. While that is a colosally tall order, I think it would be more effective than having a special programme - as we have with CSPE and SPHE"* **Adult Education Participant**

Two of the interviewees commented on the work of NYCI on development education and the lessons learned from it. A representative of development education felt that their experience of working to integrate development education into the youth sector via a programme approach was not the most successful way to integrate development education, "if you want to integrate development education effectively within an organisation, you need to take a whole organisation approach."

The majority of cases felt that increasing opportunities to engage in modules or programme purely focused on development education was also worthwhile alongside an embedded approach and mentioned the development of more FETAC modules in development education or global citizenship. Some of those from the adult education sector felt that the terminology was inaccessible and that bringing development education in thematically, rather than calling it that would facilitate its integration.

In particular, adult basic education and community education were named as sites where integrating development education could be done relatively easily since the mode of provision was perceived to be more flexible than other adult learning provision. In their interviews, the two representatives from the adult basic education sector could immediately see how a global dimension could be brought into any number of learning opportunities, including cookery, sewing and horticulture. A participant from the adult education sector said:

*"If there's a chance of making people or facilitating make connections between their life and issues at global level its in literacy and community education that its going to occur because a) you can get at level 3 or 4 its about pursuing a very specific educational programme but in the early stages they're exploring themselves – there's an opportunity."*
**Adult Education Participant**

Three cases referred to community education being a type of adult education provision into which development education could be more easily integrated and three more specified adult basic education. The rest of the cases named a number of different types of provision but no other common themes emerged from their responses.

Four of the cases commented on how the current focus on progression and individualism in adult and community education could impede the broad integration of development education.
Three of the interview participants mentioned that it would be important

to integrate development education into adult and community education in such a way that it was clear that doing development education would help educators reach already existing learning aims, be seen as a good source for classroom materials, or match organisational strategic plans, "[You need to] make an argument in terms of how valuable development education is in achieving the benefits and goals of adult education" (adult education participant).

Four of the cases, including the CEF focus group and the AEO focus group cautioned that while integrating development education was worthwhile it would be difficult to prioritise it given the other competing priorities for adult learning.

Participants identified a number of strategies to achieve the goal of an embedded integration to development education. The most commonly named approaches were:

- A bottom-up approach encompassing consultation with learners, tutors and the adult education professional bodies (AEOA, CEFA, IVEA).
- Promotion and awareness raising about what development education is and how it is not an add-on or extra work.
- It needs a national process. In particular, the CEFs and the AEOs felt that they could not move on integration without a national directive to do so.
- The strategy would need to identify drivers and multipliers.
- Champions or highly visible examples would need to inform people's thinking and inspire action.
- Embedded integration would need to be piloted in some VECs as part of the strategy.
- It would include training or CPD for educators.
- There would be a national, interagency advisory group to oversee the planning and implementation of the strategy.
- Research into the benefits of and possibilities for integrating development education would be important.

Some of the development education participants were asked to identify the reasons as to why many development education organisations had not taken a strategic focus on working with the adult and community education sector to date. They all said that a lack of knowledge of the sector and how it worked were the reasons, "It's not so easy because the sector is so disparate. If you want to access schools, that's not so easy either, but you can use bodies that are already functioning and communicating with each other to try to get it into the curriculum" (development education participant).

### 6.3.4 Strategy Stakeholders and Roles

A number of stakeholders were identified for a strategy to integrate development education into adult education as were actions for those stakeholders. Some stakeholders were named more often than others. A key finding of the research is that, on the whole development education organisations were not familiar with adult education stakeholders and adult education participants were not familiar with their colleagues in development education. The following results are notable.

- Half of the development education participants and one adult education case were not familiar with AONTAS.
- None of the adult education cases mentioned IDEA as a stakeholder, although some mentioned 'the development education sector' or 'development organisations' as stakeholders.
- Six of the development education interview participants did not mention the VECs or any personnel working in them as stakeholders for the strategy. FETAC was named most often as a stakeholder by this constituency.
- The Department of Community, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs (DCRGA), the Local Authorities and Area-Based Partnerships were only mentioned once as stakeholders.
- Workers' Unions (ICTU) and FAS were only named once as stakeholders in the strategy and this was by their representatives.

The table on the following page sets out an analysis of research participants' perceptions of who would be stakeholders for the strategy and their roles in it.

**Figure 5.2 Research Participants' Perceptions of Strategy Stakeholders and Roles**

| Organisation | Role |
|---|---|
| AONTAS | • Drive and promote strategy working with other partners – hosting interagency group<br>• Lobby/ facilitate debate about core purpose of adult education, relevance of development education<br>• Networking – entry point to adult education sector |
| Irish Aid | • Funding of plan, implementation and pilot projects<br>• Provide information on issues, case studies/ models of good practice<br>• Engage in awareness-raising and promotion about development education |
| IDEA/ Development Education Sector[2] | • Link with adult education multipliers to provide expertise and advice on how to integrate development education<br>• Develop resources/ models of good practice<br>• Provide some funding |
| Department of Education and Science (DES) | • Fund projects/ provide incentives<br>• Commit to and promote the strategy |
| IVEA | • Promote awareness of relevance of development education to VECs<br>• Work with VECs to encourage ownership of strategy |
| VECs | • Deliver CPD<br>• Consult with stakeholders at local level<br>• Put integration into education plans<br>• CEFs, AEOs, ALOs and CEOs are multipliers – discuss in their associations |
| FETAC | • Accredit more development education courses at all levels |
| Adult/ Community Educators/ Providers | • Raise development education as an issue for VEC education plan |
| Adult Learners | • Raise development education as an issue for VEC education plan |
| NALA | • Develop resources<br>• Promote the strategy |
| Relevant Third Level Institutions | • Scope pathways for progression for development education<br>• Include development education as part of CPD for adult educators |

All of these stakeholders were most often named as possible members for a national group to plan and implement the strategy. Other stakeholders mentioned included:

- Teachers Union of Ireland (TUI)
- 80:20
- Dochas
- TASC and the Task Force on Active Citizenship
- NYCI
- VTOS

### 6.3.5 Ideas for Integrating Development Education

As well as articulating what would need to happen at the strategic level the interview and focus group participants named existing or potential opportunities for integrating development education at course and programme level. The most commonly named opportunities that emerged here were:

- Case studies or themes across courses or inserted into FETAC modules
- History
- Geography
- Politics
- Economics
- Diversity training for VEC personnel
- Communications
- Personal development, effectiveness
- Social care, social studies
- Modules specifically focused on development education or global citizenship
- Community development

Of note is that a number of participants talked about how they had participated in or supported the provision of voter education by the Vincentian Partnership. They noted the value of adding a global dimension to this training since making people aware of others' disenfranchisement around the world could awaken them to the power of their own franchise.

### 6.3.6 Outcomes for Adult Learners

All of the interview and focus group data including the learner's focus group were analysed to see what was said about the possible and appropriate outcomes for adult learners as a result of engaging with development education in adult and community education settings.

When participants talked about the overlapping purpose of the three practices they often mentioned the outcomes for people that could occur

as a result of them being linked. Interviewees were also specifically asked about what skills development education could foster for active citizenship. The following represent the themes emerging. Development education can enable learners:

- To take action and foster the skills necessary to do that such as critical analysis, research skills and value-based decision-making.
- The means to participate in their community and the democratic system.
- To be aware of how the structures and systems in our society work and knowledge of options for action.
- To become more confident and empowered.

When asked whether or not active citizenship should be an explicit outcome of development education in adult education eighteen of the cases agreed that it should be. However, six interviewees stated that the definition of active citizenship implicit in this outcome should be wide. In other words, the possibilities for action should not be a pre-defined set in accordance with the State definition of active citizenship.

An elaboration on what forms active citizenship resulting from development education can take will be considered in the case study chapter.

In order to demonstrate the outcomes for learners from development education from their perspective let us turn to the results of the focus group with adult learners.[97]

This focus group set out some clear benefits and impacts to exploring development education and active citizenship and they are indicated in the table overleaf.

## Figure 5.3 Benefits and Impacts on Adult Learners

| Benefits Gained | Impact on Personal Lives |
|---|---|
| • Brought group closer together<br>• Increased community spirit<br>• Gained confidence<br>• More sympathetic to other people's situation<br>• Gave another way to look at own community and others' community | • Gained confidence<br>• *More knowledge made me feel more powerful*<br>• *I felt as though I could talk about things with my family or friends without feeling stupid*<br>• *Child slavery video made me feel very sad* – led group to adopt a boy in Lesotho<br>• Learned new vocabulary – social change, parliament, commitment<br>• *I became more aware as a citizen as I had never voted before* |

## 6.3.7 Discussion of Qualitative Data

The data gleaned from the interviews and focus groups gives some key findings for this research. Explorations of participants' understandings of the purpose of the three practices reveal that there is no shared definition of each of them amongst the different sectors. However, a majority of the participants did indicate a critical purpose for active citizenship.

None of the cases saw adult and community education purely in terms of a human capital development purpose, which indicates that despite a policy focus on this approach to adult and community education those in the key strategic positions sampled for the research resist this emphasis.

A mixed set of responses to the purpose of development education illustrates that an evolution from a soft, charity approach to a critical development education has not occurred for those in the adult and community education sector. In particular, many adult education cases displayed a liberal understanding of the process or did not see it as encompassing a global perspective. This finding demonstrates that there may not be a currency for the term in adult and community education practice and adjectives may be better used to describe it so that it is not confused with education for personal or community development.

Through the dialogue in the interviews and the focus groups cases saw an overlap between the three practices and could see a role for adult and community education in engaging adults in thinking about issues of global injustice or inequality. They felt that an appropriate outcome should be active citizenship but cautioned against that concept being understood in the context of the State definition.

An important finding is that the majority of respondents said that integration of development education should happen by way of an embedded approach and not solely as stand-alone modules. They could see the value of development education processes and topics in encouraging civic competence, but also stressed that it would develop other competences in learners. This feedback is consistent with the context review and the idea that development education can assist learners to cultivate other priority competences in lifelong learning.

Some cautioned that setting development education as a priority amongst others would mean that it might be forgotten in the face of other priorities like literacy. However, responses indicate that adult basic education and community education might be an ideal site in which to integrate a global dimension because the learners can reach learning outcomes by engaging with the content. This strategy would satisfy those respondents who stressed that development education should not be an add on.

Clear recommendations were given for stakeholders and their roles in a strategy to integrate development education into adult and community education.  The professional associations for key adult and community education personnel were named as multipliers for this work. Many of the cases said that they would welcome further discussion and consultation on the matter and given that many were in strategic roles, this data suggests that strategic personnel who could connect with their grassroots to promote integration could facilitate ownership of the strategy.

However, this work requires the development education and the adult and community education sectors familiarity with each others' work and the research shows, to date, that this networking has not taken place.

In light of recent changes in the adult and community education environment with FETAC any follow-up on respondents recommendations to create more FETAC opportunities in development education will need to be done at national level through a consortium or national organisation.

The qualitative data shows it matters what types of provision and to which learners development education is introduced. That is not to say that all adult and community education provision could not have development education integrated into it, but that in order to seed the sector it might be better to start with adult basic education and community education with the buy-in of the VECs through the IVEA.

It would seem that if development education was pitched to educators as something which could help them do their job better it would gain momentum. In particular, it was recommended for those working in adult literacy and community education, but also for those who are providing the types of courses reflected on in Section 5.1.6. This suggestion is consistent with the recommendation of an embedded approach where development education could be brought in via themes to existing provision.

The data gleaned on outcomes for learners shows how development education is a powerful tool for engaging learners, fostering their confidence while at the same time developing key competences including active citizenship.

The majority of respondents indicated that development education held the potential to create critical global citizenship and that it was appropriate to name that specifically. Some agreed that, that might be a way to 'sell' development education, but there was no consensus.

An interesting finding was some respondents' reflections that this research offered an opportunity for adult and community educators to debate the fundamental purpose of adult education and that any discussions about integration should include this debate.

### 7 **Case Studies**

This chapter presents the case studies compiled for the research and a discussion of findings from them. The following organisations contributed to case studies:

- The Shanty Education and Training Centre in An Cosan, an education, enterprise and childcare centre in Tallaght, Dublin contributed a case study of some development education work they did with a drugs rehabilitation group in the area.
- Kerry Action for Development Education (KADE), a development education group in County Kerry, contributed to a case study about a training for trainers course for adult educators they partnered with their local area-based partnership to deliver.
- Access 2000, a women's community education group in Wexford, provided data for a case study about a course they worked with Banulacht to deliver for local women, which focused on gender and development.
- The Adult Literacy and Basic Education Centre in Moyderwell, Tralee, County Kerry, contributed to case study about a literacy and basic education group who participated in a development education programme to further their literacy skills.
- Lourdes Youth and Community Services (LYCS) provided data for a case study about a women and leadership programme they ran in the northeast inner city of Dublin.

Of note is that case studies were sourced via the survey carried out for the research and only 25 or about ten percent of those surveyed indicated that they could be a potential case study. Attempts were made to contact all 25, yet only six met the criteria for a case study and one of these declined to participate.[98]

## *7.1 The Shanty Education and Training Centre*

The Shanty Education and Training Centre  in Tallaght , Dublin designed and delivered a development education course for a local drugs centr to a group of participants on a drug stabilisation programme. This case study is an example of how development education can be used in adult education to look at the global nature of social exclusion while at the same time assisting learners in basic skills development.

The nine week module aimed to offer a basic intoduction to development education by exploring:

---

98    The researcher could not make contact with XX of these respondents.

- Development education and global citizenship – what did the terms mean, looking at human needs, rights and responsibilities, working towards a better futures
- One world – appreciating our interconnectedness, investigating inequality and poverty
- Local and global development – examining development at local level and across the planet
- The environment – appreciating environmental damage and caring for the Earth

The course used participatory methodologies including discussion and collage. The stated outcomes for learners were that they would:

- Gain an understanding of how interdependent and unequal our world is.
- Engage in analysis, debate and reflection on key issues in development education.
- Identify practical ways in which they can contribute to making a more just world.
- Strengthen their belief that they can make a difference in the world.

The tutor explored the interconnectedness of human beings on the planet using the heroin and cocaine trade as an example. She said,

*Given their own drug use, they could understand the connections and consequences very clearly. They could understand why there might be poverty, violence and devastation in (for example) Colombia and Afghanistan. Having worked in Colombia, I had first hand experience to share from a different perspective and participants were really open to hearing that.*

Participation in the module resulted in the group devising a number of actions that they carried out such as:

- Recycling (clothes, packaging)
- Buying fair trade products
- Energy saving (cutting down on the use of electricity, gas, petrol)
- Voicing issues to relevant bodies (e.g. clinics of counsellors and TDs, drug service users' forum)
- Registering to vote
- Involvement in the stabilisation programme itself

In regard to the last action the facilitator of the module said,

*"Trying to get off drugs, to lead a healthier, happier and less anti-social lifestyle was a big step towards active citizenship. Taking responsibility for their lives and families was a way of becoming active, engaged members of society… The skills practised by the participants in the course included literacy, social skills, listening skills, problem-solving, thinking and*

*reflecting, discussion, decision-making and time management.*

Participative evaluations done with the learners show that the planned outcomes for learners were met. The evaluation also showed that there were unplanned outcomes for the work. Namely, the high engagement in the content made the literacy work more effective as participants were highly interested in reading about the issues explored and their confidence and self-esteem improved as a result.

This case demonstrates that facilitating a group to see how their experiences of social exclusion are mirrored by and directly connected to those of others in other countries can facilitate individual and collective empowerment. The facilitator listening carefully for themes relevant to the learners' experiences and using those themes to explore development education and global citizenship fostered this process.

## 7.2 KADE

From 2004-2005, Kerry Action for Development Education (KADE) a development education centre  was contracted by South Kerry Development Partnership to deliver a training course on development education for adult education tutors in the South West Kerry Guidance Network (SWGN)[99]. This case study demonstrates how a training programme can incorporate explicit outcomes related to active citizenship. The objectives of this training were to:

- Provide high quality innovative education and training methodologies in DE themes such as fair trade, globalisation, and world debt so as to create awareness of development issues among the tutors and the general public in South Kerry.
- Train tutors in the adult education centres who work on adult education programmes; train tutors in DE concepts, methodologies and resources to explore values, beliefs and behaviour and enhance the skills of the tutors.
- Organise workshops for the target groups of the trained tutors, featuring selected development issues. It is envisaged that there will be practical sessions / interactive sessions incorporating exercises which will improve the awareness of and knowledge of the general community on the above themes and encourage them to initiate their own action(s) where feasible.
- Review and evaluate all project activities to ensure continuing relevance and good training and management practice for the duration of the

99    The Network is a group of community organisations involved in adult and community education provision in Kerry.

project[100].

Nine participants became involved in the training from a range of groups in the Network. Tutors from the adult education centre were not able to participate since they could not access funding from the Kerry Education Service to attend although the Director of the centre did come to some sessions. The training was developed and delivered by KADE (with some inputs delivered in collaboration with a trainer from the Debt and Development Coalition).

As a result of the exploration of the issues named in the objectives, the group was asked to take on actions that they could choose. They devised and engaged in a number of local actions. They were:

- Mounting a Fair Trade exhibition in Cahirsiveen, including talks to local schools attending the exhibition and the attendance of 100 local people at the event
- Establishing a co-ordinating committee to make Cahirsiveen a Fair Trade town
- Participating in a 'Make Poverty History' campaign including arranging a photo opportunity for it with the Minister for Arts , Sports and Tourism.

All of these actions received coverage by the local print and radio media.

The concept of active citizenship was not explored explicitly, although the tutor describes how the development education process was a process for active citizenship, "One could argue that the overall content of the course featured and concerned active citizenship, however." She articulates the impact of the programme on local civil society, "The participants as members of the local community have experienced increased awareness of development and poverty issues and exhibited solidarity through their project actions."

This case study illustrates that action is an objective for development education and can be named explicitly in programme design.


## 7.3 Moyderwell Adult Education Centre

The Adult Literacy and Basic Education Group in the Moyderwell Adult Education Centre in Tralee, County Kerry is provided under the auspices of the Kerry Education Service or Kerry VEC. This group is a case study in how the desire to gain knowledge and skills for active citizenship can be a progression from an exploration of global issues.

---

100    Excerpt from SKDP Project Plan.

In 2004 this group of ten participants came together to improve their literacy skills. In order to achieve this aim the tutor offered them a development education course with the following aims:

- To provide adult literacy learners with an opportunity to improve reading and writing skills
- To introduce development education issues and themes in order to develop a broader world view and learn about different countries and cultures

Using the NALA *Worldwise* resource, the course covered issues like poverty, inequality and injustice. Learners were challenged about their perceptions and asked to make connections between poverty, injustice and world conflicts. Some of the students were from RAPID areas in Tralee. These are socially excluded communities in Tralee and are being targeted for poverty reduction and social inclusion interventions. They made connections between their own marginalisation and those of others around the world and "*started to see themselves in a different way*" **Course Tutor**

After completing the development education content in 2006 the tutor consulted with the learners about what they wanted to do next.

> "*They wanted to continue to develop and learn about what they had learned in the course. I think they wanted to look further at their responsibilities, they saw themselves as more of a community and wanted to learn more about their world and their place in it*" **Course Tutor**

The tutor suggested a range of possible activities and the one chosen was a voter education project encompassing the Vincentian Partnership Voter Education Programme since it was an election year and many in the group had never exercised their vote. This project involved the tutor and the group brainstorming a number of possible actions that the group could take collectively. The participants themselves came up with and engaged in the following:

- Adopted a little boy from Lesotho and held a coffee morning with a raffle through which they fundraised for the boy.
- This coffee morning was a fundraising event at which students showed a video about child labour.
- Before the general election students held another coffee morning and displayed a Wall of Issues which were photographs of what they felt to be important local and national election issues.
- With the tutor's assistance they wrote and performed a play called "*Standing at the Crossroads*" about a first time voter with literacy difficulties. This play was performed in a variety of places including for the Lord Mayor in Dublin.
- The group made contact with their local politicians and visited a local TDs clinic
- The group visited the Dail.

After this the group went on to do a FETAC module entitled *Living in a Diverse Society* which had, by its very nature a development education component. While there was not a specific lesson on global citizenship in the activities described, this understanding of what it means to be a citizen permeated all the activities, according to the tutor of the group. In addition to the planned outcomes for participants such as the improvement in literacy skills the group also gained:

- Improved technological skills (as they had to learn to use digital cameras for the Wall of Issues)
- Ability to critically reflect rather than just focusing on acquisition of literacy skills
- Self-directed learning
- Ability to organise information into dramatic form
- Improved communication skills, and
- A broader world view.

It is the contention of the tutor that the broader worldview facilitated by the development education activities made it possible for the participants to see themselves as citizens and facilitated them to see the voter education project as something that was relevant to them. In other words, the case presented here shows how development education can facilitate those who have little access to the political process to gain the skills and confidence necessary to contribute to participatory democracy.


## 7.4 Access 2000

Access 2000 is a womens's community education group. In 2008 they partnered with Banulacht to provide an introductory course to local women about gender and development. The course was called "Women Worldwide Making Connections" and is a Banulacht training resource. Banulacht delivered the training while Access 2000 promoted the course locally, targeting women who had an interest in global issues and also the capacity to mobilise other local women. This case study is an example of how exploring development education can result in community leadership, integration and global citizenship.

The programme was run according to the practice and principles of community education which meant that the course was participatory and the issues explored came from the group themselves. The aim was to raise awareness of issues that affect women locally in relation to poverty, women's human rights and exclusion and to then link those issues globally. Outcomes for learners were to be:

- They would reach an understanding of issues common to women everywhere
- Develop awareness of women's experiences in relation to those issues at

home and abroad, and
- Develop solidarity as a group and with the world community of women.

The group explored the global nature of women's experiences of human rights violations, work and violence against women. Active citizenship as a concept was not explored by the group. However, they did examine how women's inequality globally inspired the global women's movement. The membership of the group was diverse. According to the Co-ordinator of Access 2000, "This course was different. Four women from the Travelling community were participating in the group and that was the first time a really integrated programme like that has happened here."

On foot of their explorations the group decided that they wanted to act. Banulacht had timed delivery of the course for when the Director and founding member of a Tanzanian human rights organisation called Kivulini[101] was visiting Ireland so that she could facilitate the group. The group asked the facilitator what action they could take that might benefit the organisation. As a result they collected and donated baby clothes and medical equipment to Kivulini.

However, the group went above and beyond this action. They also formed and have maintained to date, a group called TARGET. The aim of this group is to fundraise for Kivulini and raise awareness of the issues facing women in Tanzania in regard to domestic violence and human rights. The Co-ordinator of Access 2000 articulates that the participants on the course practiced the following skills:

- Groupwork and organisational skills
- Facilitation and leadership
- Critical social analysis
- Networking
- Intercultural competence
- Empathy and solidarity

An unplanned outcome was the exploration of discrimination and human rights violations for the Travelling community. By exploring the nature of racism globally, the group began to reflect on the nature of racism against Travellers in Ireland. The members of the Traveller Women's Network who attended the course reported a huge impact from the experience.

This case study shows how an awareness of the global nature of issues can enable critical reflection on how they play out closer to home and encourage integration. It can also motivate solidarity between women locally and internationally. Access 2000 regularly integrates development education into its work through its commitment to the women's community education *Quality Assurance Framework*. Through this assurance it regularly reviews its work to ensure that it is reflecting on the experiences of women globally.

---

101    See www.kivulini.org. Kivulini focuses on the eradication of domestic violence.

## 7.5 LYCS

Lourdes Youth and Community Services (LYCS) is an adult education centre in the north inner city of Dublin. In 2005, it partnered with Cairde[102] to carry out a *Women as Leaders* (WAL) two-year programme for 15 women from Dublin's northeast inner city (NEIC). As part of that programme LYCS delivered a FETAC Level 4 module called *Global Development Awareness*. This case study demonstrates how development education can enable participants to become involved in local civil society as well as fostering women's leadership and local and global solidarity between women.

The aim of the WAL programme was to develop the leadership capacity of minority ethnic women and women from Dublin's NEIC. The group profile included local Irish women and ethnic minority women. The objectives of the overall programme were:

- To equip minority women and local Irish women from the NEIC with knowledge and skills for effective leadership to address interconnected issues of poverty, social exclusion and racism in the NEIC.
- To raise the profile of the interconnected issues of poverty, social exclusion and racism within the community and develop appropriate local responses.
- To improve the capacity of the women to be a resource to the NEIC by becoming leaders in addressing racism and accommodating diversity.

In year one the groups trained separately. The ethnic minority women studied community development while the local Irish women studied the FETAC Level 4 Global Development Awareness module. This module's objectives were to:

- Gain a basic understanding of the concept of development and what it means for communities at both a local and global level
- Explore some of the issues facing the developing world
- Examine the links between own context and that of the developing world
- Gain an insight into how individuals and groups can promote development.

As this module was part of a broader programme the women also received assertiveness and leadership training so there was a crossover in the learning. The course in Global Development Awareness started from where the participants "were at". They chose what issues they wanted to explore in order to reach the objectives. In this case the group chose to explore racism and discrimination. Tandem to that they also looked at the historic

---

102     See www.cairde.ie The organisation is a *community development organisation working to tackle health inequalities among ethnic minority communities by improving ethnic minority access to health services and ethnic minority participation in health planning and delivery.*

relationship between the "developed" and the "underdeveloped" world and a social analysis of poverty and its root causes.

The concept of active citizenship was not explored explicitly but they were encouraged to think about features of a critical citizenship by looking at links between women worldwide, the role of women in society, mapping power relations in their local area, looked at different types of collective action and social movements, and at how they could become active locally. They also participated in voter education.

This module allowed the participants to find their voice on global issues. Many who had never really watched the news began to watch it critically and to discuss social, economic and political issues with their peers. In year two, the two groups of women joined together and began to work on actions, thinking about the links between their own experiences and those of other women around the world. The forms of active citizenship they engaged in included:

- Considered women's health status in their community, wrote to the college of General Practitioners about it and met a representative of the college to discuss their concerns.
- Organised a seminar that focused on issues of inequality, health and education, attended by the President, and attained media coverage for it (the event launched a publication developed by participants that set out their experiences of working together and sharing experiences of inequality).
- Prepared a report "Women as Leaders in Equality Programme 2005 – 2007" that was an expression of issues faced by local women and ethnic minority women in an Irish and Global context
- Lobbied local service providers, the media, and politicians in relation to the issues expressed in the report.
- Took part in policy focus groups and the LYCS advisory group to the adult education programme

The outcomes for the participants were manifold. As well as learning and practicing skills like writing, researching, working in groups, interviewing and critical awareness, the module assisted them to progress onto a range of leadership roles. Of note are:

- One of the local Irish women has travelled to Tanzania as part of an exchange project with Banulacht and is now travelling around Ireland sharing her experiences
- Two have continued a women's studies course,
- One has become chairperson of the parents association and delivers literacy to parents of school children
- Another delivers an adult education class and organises a social committee

- Two are volunteers in an adult education centre.

LYCS aim to integrate development education wherever they can fit it into existing curriculum as well as offering dedicated courses. This whole organisation approach ensures that participants are offered the chance to explore the global dimension of anything from cookery to poverty. In this case, the global development module enhanced women's participation in civil society and assisted the creation of an intercultural space for the WAL programme. As the two groups of women were able to see that the issues they faced were interconnected they found the group solidarity they needed to support them to take action and move into leadership roles. This case also shows how development education and active citizenship can prepare learners to struggle for gender equality locally and globally.

## 7.6 Discussion

It is evident from these case studies that an exploration of global issues, injustice and inequality using development education methodologies can have wide-ranging impacts on adult learners. It helps to develop many of the key competences important in lifelong learning set out in the context review. In particular, the case studies explored here assisted the learners to develop interpersonal, intercultural, social and civic competence as well as learning to learn and communication skills.

The case studies mirror the benefits of development education for adults described in the literature. In Tallaght, the group explored the global impact of drug taking in their community and understood the way in which decisions taken in Ireland can affect those in other countries. All of the cases explored the global nature of social exclusion.

In all of the cases the learners acted to enhance local civil society. For instance, the learners in Kerry engaged in local civil society activities on foot of their participation in the KADE programme.

It is clear that participation in the activities described in the case studies resulted in learners becoming active citizens. It appears that these actions encompassed a critical global citizenship where learners not only increased their participation in existing avenues for action, but were sometimes critical of them. In some cases, they came up with alternative arrangements for democratic participation or acting to address human rights injustces internationally. The actions specified in the case studies are wide-ranging and are not confined to voting or volunteering.

The case studies show that only one facilitator explicitly referred to the concept of active citizenship with their group of learners. This finding could suggest that there is not a currency for the term in development education provision. It could also demonstrate that, while action is seen as a desired outcome for development education, adult and community educators do

not want to confine it to the narrow set of actions that the interviewees and focus groups have said that 'active citizenship' connotes in Ireland.

It is notable that the majority of cases were of activities delivered in the context of adult basic education and community education. While this sample is not representative of all the development education provided to adults in Ireland, it does show that the processes and methods employed in these two types of provision are a good fit for development education.

A key theme arising from the cases is that taking a global dimension to the learning broadened the world of participants that, in turn, resulted in an increased sense of agency for them. This agency fostered confidence, assisted engagement in the learning and led to participants taking action to address both local and global issues. It also fostered participants' insight into their own lives and communities.

# 8 Discussion

This chapter explored whether or not the first four of the research objectives was reached and the conclusions arising in relation to them. Each section title reflects the research objective explored in it.

## 8.1 Extent of Development Education in the Adult and Community Education Sector

The research shows that the practice of development education is not widespread in the adult and community education sector in Ireland. Since the sample of providers invited to complete the survey was meant to be representative of provision in Ireland, the survey results show that less than a quarter of provision engages in development education. This exploration happens most often through the use of materials about global issues or human rights tools.

The qualitative data shows that there is not a strategic focus on the provision of development education in mainstream adult and community education provision. Many of the cases felt that development education must be happening in adult and community education, but reported that it was not being made explicit in the provision that they knew about and could not give examples of activities that had been carried out.

The data cautiously points to adult basic education and community education as the type of provision where development education could be easily achieved.

It is clear that where development education is happening it is and can have important outcomes for learners. Development education can assist learners to develop a number of the key priorities for lifelong learning, both in Ireland and at EU level. The data presented in this research shows that development education is a powerful tool for achieving these aims that result in learners seeing themselves, their communities and the world in a new light.

## 8.2 Understanding of Development Education and Active Citizenship

The research has shown that there is no shared understanding of the purpose of these two practices in the context of adult and community education in Ireland. Although, the data collected through the survey did indicate that those respondents espoused a critical understanding of the two practices. It is interesting that, in the focus groups and interviews there was also no shared understanding of the purpose of adult and community education.

Fostering critical global citizenship for adults is dependent on adult and community educators' commitment to critical understandings of the three practices. The results of the research are promising in this regard, Namely, most of the participants did lean towards a critical citizenship and none described a purely human capital purpose for adult education.

Therefore, the research points to a need for stakeholders in adult and community education in Ireland and openness from them to discuss and agree the fundamental purpose of the three practices. This discussion also holds the potential to demonstrate the importance of a critical adult and community education that is a force for equality in Ireland.

In a recent meeting the EAEA General Assembly generated and adopted a statement on intercultural learning, what it was and how it could be achieved.[103] A similar process in regard to adult and community education, active citizenship and development education might be of value to adult and community educators in Ireland.

Of note, is that development education in the context of adult and community education may only be understood as education for personal and community development. This finding supports the need for discussion of a shared purpose for the practice. It may also mean adult and community educators would prefer different terminology for the practice. The survey suggested that adult and community educators are not aware of the practical topics that can be explored through development education.

As the context review pointed out, there is a gap in policy commitments to foster active citizenship or civic competence in Ireland and the EU and implementing those commitments. As such, the data shows encouraging adult and community educators to use development education as a process for citizenship education would be worthwhile. However, it is not clear if promoting development education through active citizenship is the main way to encourage providers to practice it.

Perhaps, it is not a negative finding that some educators saw development education as being solely about personal and community development. As a process for critical global active citizenship, it is as much about that as it is about global issues. If development education is perceived by adult and community educators as only about international education and not about development processes that affect all of us it may be difficult to close the distance between adult and community education and development education. If it is promoted for its capacity to help adults learn about themselves and realise social justice at home and abroad, it may seem more relevant to adult and community educators.

The majority of participants did see the connection between development education and active citizenship or action for social change. However,

---

103    See www.eaea.or *EAEA adopts statement on intercultural learning in Malahide*

this connection was sometimes only made for the first time through the dialogue prompted by the interviews and focus groups. Importantly, while active citizenship was deemed to be an appropriate explicit outcome for development education, many cautioned against using the term by itself without specifying that action can take many forms. They specified the need to allow for the potential of development education to foster a wide range of actions that cannot be exhaustively defined prior to course delivery.

It is evident from the case studies that development education has the potential to foster global citizenship where learners develop the skills and confidence to act locally and globally. However, this potential could be blocked by a State commitment to a liberal notion of active citizenship.

## 8.3 Comparisons between Community Education and Development Education

There is an overlap between community education and development education. The case studies and some of the qualitative data show that the features shared by the two types of provision are Freirean methodologies, flexible provision, learner defined content, community development, critical analysis and individual and collective empowerment. Community education was seen as a good fit for development education. Having a global dimension to learning helped to achieve the aims of the activities presented. Moreover, it sometimes made the work more effective, because it allowed learners' to broaden their perspective, which, in turn, assisted a critical analysis of their own situations.

The research has also shown an overlap between the methodologies and aims of adult basic education which include the development of literacy skills through themes that are relevant to participants' lives and the need to develop participants' self-confidence and sense of agency.

These overlaps suggest the ALOs and CEFS may be the first personnel who could be engaged with in terms of the integration of development education. It is in these more informal spaces that the critical or justice overlaps between the three practices can be most easily implemented and development education can be employed, not just to increase participants' awareness of global issues, but to contribute to the realisation of different social justice agendas nationally such as anti-poverty, feminist and anti-racism and drugs prevention work.

## 8.4 Supports, Structures and Resources for Integration of Development Education and Active Citizenship

Development education can help adult and community educators to explore

the global dimension of citizenship and can foster individual and collective action for social change. The research shows support for an embedded approach to integrating development education into adult education. While the value of development education is that it is a process for global citizenship it is also valuable as a process for helping educators achieve existing priorities and can be threaded through provision thematically or through case studies. Many participants felt this strategy was the most appropriate one albeit a long-term aim. Alongside this strategy more opportunities could also be created for learners to engage in courses solely focused on development education or global citizenship.

### 8.4.1    Supports and Resources

It is evident that adult and community educators need training to embed development education into what they are doing. The research shows that they will need to have their awareness raised as to the definition of development education. They will then need to know how development education can also help them to achieve existing learning outcomes for programmes.

The data suggests that educators will need training on the practical ways in which they can do development education. Namely, they will need information on best practice case studies of how development education can happen in adult and community education. They will also need to know the extensive range of topics or themes that can be explored such as water, gender, governance, climate and so on. They will need materials to support this work. One resource that could meet the need of community education providers is the LYCS resource *Connecting Communities.*

One of the arguments arising from the context review is that development education can assist educators to realise the achievement of existing learning outcomes that involve mastery of skills or competences. While this emphasis may be a way of promoting development education to those who favour a more functional approach to adult and community education it will be crucial for those working to provide supports and resources from a strategic perspective to introduce the possibility of doing development education from a critical stance as well. It will be important for an interagency steering group to develop criteria around what best practice of a critical development education in adult and community education could be and to promote this, not just in tangible resources, but throughout networking and training.

The research suggests that the development educators and adult and community educators are not aware of each other's work and how the sectors operate. Integration will need to be supported through opportunities for the sectors to network and cross-fertilise each other's work.

National development organisations or IDEA could link with the professional associations representing key adult and community education personnel

to scope their training needs and what FETAC courses they could develop resources for. For instance, Comhlamh already works to provide development education opportunities for adults and could promote what it does through the professional associations. The research tentatively pointed to the types of courses that development education could fit into such as social care, communications, community development and personal development courses.

The integration of development education can be supported by the development of FETAC modules and awards. However, given the recent changes made by FETAC in terms of the development of awards, this work will have to happen strategically at a national level. A national body will need to survey the available certified modules on development education, global citizenship or another adjectival education, discern the gaps and put forward a case for further modules or awards to FETAC.

Integration will also need to be supported by CPD for adult and community educators. Stakeholders will need to promote the relevance for third level providers to integrate development education into qualifications for adult and community educators. The IVEA has just developed a strategy for CPD in Ireland (unpublished). Stakeholders could link with the IVEA to discuss that strategy and see if development education could be integrated into it.

Any integration will need to be resourced financially. Irish Aid already funds development education activities as do Concern. They could engage in more focused promotion of available funding to the adult and community education sector. The Department of Education and Science could consider making a commitment to development education as a way to foster civic competence in lifelong learning and suggest that providers consider its integration.

It is notable that the findings of this research show that how adult and community educators see integration happening goes beyond the commitments made in the Irish Aid strategy for development education. The qualitative data shows that there are multiple sites for support of educators and that integration could happen in a variety of ways other than in community education through FETAC accredited modules. There is latent potential to embed development education across adult and community education through themes.

## 8.4.2    Structures

The research shows that there are already a number of structures in adult and community education that could be used to support the integration of development education into adult and community education in Ireland. Participants clearly said that those avenues should be explored. Rarely, did they suggest new structures save for an interagency steering group to plan and implement a strategy for integration.

IDEA is the structure through which further thinking about best practice and dedicated development education courses and programmes could happen. Likewise, consultation, ownership and the implementation plan for a strategy should be cultivated through the professional associations representing key adult and community education personnel in Ireland.

The context review presented four international examples of integration of development education or citizenship education into adult learning. It is likely that an Irish strategy could embrace elements of each one. Like the Scottish example, county development boards, local adult learning boards and/ or area-based partnerships could consider the integration of development education into their planning of interventions and services.

As in the German example the IVEA and AONTAS could consider how it might promote and resource VECs to integrate development education. This work could be supported by IDEA or interested national development organisations. The research presented some mechanisms for this work including suggesting that VECs ask their constituents to consider including development education in their education plans. Development education could also be presented to the development teams in VECs as an option for meeting adult learners' needs locally.

The UK example shows how dedicated development education groups in local areas throughout the country could be resourced to act as local resources for the best practice of development education. In fact, Irish Aid already funds capacity building for development education groups.

The Finnish example demonstrated how EDC could be a requirement in basic education, when it is seen as distinct from other education policy, obligated by law and implemented through required tutor hours and student councils. Adult and community education stakeholders in Ireland could consider this strategy as an option.

There will need to be further consultation and debate about what structures could support the integration of development education into adult and community education. As already indicated above, it is just as important what structures are put in place as is how those structures go about their work and what theoretical foundations inform those methods, because there are so many contested concepts involved in this exercise.

For any structures put in place there needs to be room for a diverse range of voices from the sectors and a dedication to creating consensus about and making explicit the shared purpose of the three practices. In other words, interaction on these structures needs to model participatory democracy.

Lastly, the research suggests that the embedded approach to development education should be piloted in a number of areas before it is rolled out nationally.

## 8.5 In closing

This research was exploratory in nature and poses questions which adult and community education providers, and development education and civil society groups could conduct further research on or pose as questions to their learners and within their organisations. Those questions are as follows:

- What are the longitudinal impacts of development education on adult learners?
- What are the longitudinal impacts on civil society and participatory democracy when adults have the opportunity to engage in development education?
- What are the gaps in certified opportunities to learn about development education and global citizenship?
- What are the specific needs of each of the constituencies (ie ALOs, CEFs, AEOs) in relation to integrating development education?
- Which FETAC modules could consider a global dimension? Which of these would adult and community educators appreciate having resources for?

While there may be more questions than answers this research does point to a number of clear conclusions and recommendations. An overarching theme is that the research points to the potential of a strategy to integrate development education to foster a debate on the purpose of adult and community education in Ireland today.

The research has shown that, for the most part, the participants adhere to a rich, critical understanding of active citizenship that could be fostered through development education in adult and community education. This project can only be achieved if adult and community educators can continue to deliver flexible, learner-centred, critical education in a lifelong learning system that has begun to emphasise human over social capital.

In order for this to happen civil society organisations will need to lobby the Government to fulfil its requirement to be of service to its citizens and to protect adult and community education as a space that can foster a democratic society.

# 9  Conclusions & Recommendations

## 9.1 Conclusions

The key conclusions arising from this research are:

- Development education is not widely understood or practiced in adult and community education in Ireland confirming stakeholder perceptions in Irish Aid's latest strategic plan on development education.

- There is not a shared understanding of development education and active citizenship within adult and community education and this shared understanding needs to be cultivated.

- There is a general commitment to a critical citizenship from the participants in the research that contests the State's definition of active citizenship.

- There is a latent potential in the adult and community education sector to explore the integration of development education since most of the participants in the interviews and focus groups reported that it would be a worthwhile venture. Community education and adult basic education were the types of education that were considered to be a good fit for development education.

- Development education has the potential to assist adult and community educators to foster civic competence and active citizenship for learners.

- Development education can also help educators achieve other priorities in learning like literacy skills, intercultural competence, learning to learn and critical analysis.

- Integrating development education into adult and community education in Ireland can happen through existing structures such as the professional associations for key personnel, IDEA and AONTAS. The only new structure required would be an interagency group working at national level to oversee a strategy to integrate development education into adult and community education. Widespread consultation will need to be carried out with the fora named above to support this integration.

- Further development of FETAC modules and awards in development education or global citizenship will have to be supported by a national consortium.

- Development education can have powerful outcomes for communities. The potential of development education to foster social justice agendas at home as well as abroad is of relevance in community education and adult basic education.

- Development education can have powerful outcomes for individual adult learners. It will be important to promote development education in adult and community education as something that is not just about people

overseas, but also as an important process for individuals to learn about themselves and their communities.

- This research found that research participants generally did not know about the practical topics or themes that could be explored as part of development education. It will be important that any training or promotion that takes place starts by addressing this lack of knowledge.

- Given the contested theoretical terrains that need to be negotiated in integrating development education into adult and community education, how actions or recommendations are implemented will be just as important as what they are. Criteria for best practice and consensus on definitions of active citizenship, adult and community education and development education will be essential supports to this work.

## 9.2 Recommendations

### 9.2.1    Set up a Steering Committee

An interagency steering committee set up to oversee a strategy to commence integration of development education into adult and community education could:

- Consist of the representative organisations identified by the research participants in this report. These included, the IVEA, AONTAS, Irish Aid, CEFA, ALOA, AEOA, IDEA, NALA, DES, FETAC and adult/ community education providers.

- Debate and agree a workable shared purpose of the three practices explored in this research, giving due consideration to the rich overlap presented in the justice/ critical perspective shared by the three.

- Develop best practice criteria for:
  - o A strategy to integrate development education into adult and community education, including;
    - any promotion of the integration of development education into adult and community education
    - training programmes for adult and community educators about development education
    - resources and case studies that could be used by adult and community educators to facilitate development education
    - pilot projects that are chosen to test the integration

- Gain agreement that these criteria will inform how participating representative organisations go about carrying out any actions for which they take responsibility in the strategy.

- Discuss whether to feed all, some or none of the recommendations that follow into the strategy and assign responsibility for each action.

- Strive to be a model of participatory democracy.

### 9.2.2 Integrate into Policy and Strategy

Changes in policy will assist work at the grassroots level.

- Lobby the Department of Education and Science to make a policy commitment to integrating development education into adult and community education linked to funding of adult education activities.
- Lobby the Department of Education and Science to fulfil their policy commitments to foster active citizenship in lifelong learning.
- Lobby VECs to present development education to their constituencies as a possible consideration for the next education plan for the VEC area. Approach the CEO or Director of Adult Education in this regard.
- Write a submission to the Task Force on Active Citizenship highlighting the importance of the global dimension of citizenship and critical citizenship based on the research presented in this report.

### 9.2.3 Bring Together and Promote Champions

There are already a number of existing champions who can light the way for others to integrate development education with adult education, such as the D.E.A.L Project, any of the providers explored in the case studies and Comhlamh.

- Bring these champions together to discuss how best to promote the relevance of development education to the constituencies they are from and to learners themselves. For instance, the D.E.A.L project could offer wisdom as to how a VEC could approach the integration of development education into adult education.
- Support more local development education groups to become development education centres, such as those in the UK, that are resources to local providers who want to integrate development education. Those centres could also link those providers to southern organisations, which is an important aspect of development education.

### 9.2.4 Use Multipliers

There are already a number of adult and community education fora that could start a ripple effect in the promotion and relevance of development education.

- Approach the AEOA through the IVEA to offer training in development education. Then, approach CEFA and the ALOA

- Approach the AONTAS Community Education Network (CEN) to explore the possibility of offering training in development education and to see how they could work together to raise the profile of community education and development education.

- Link with PLANET to explore whether or not it would be interested in working to promote the value of development education in education interventions designed and delivered or supported by Education Officers in the area-based partnerships.

- Bring the idea of development education to local fora like the county development boards or area-based partnerships

- Link with the Social Inclusion section in FAS to promote the value of development education in their Bridging Programmes and Community Training Workshops.

- Support a spokesperson from Irish Aid or an adult and community education champion who is a member of IDEA to make the approaches identified above.

### 9.2.5    Integrate Development Education Awareness/ Training into the Continuing Professional Development of Educators

If tutors and facilitators were trained in development education, then adult learners will have the chance to engage in it.

- Lobby third level providers to integrate a development education dimension to their programmes for adult and community educators and to scope progression opportunities for those who wish to become development educators.

- Identify where the responsibility for CPD is held in each VEC around the country and lobby those stakeholders to integrate development education and critical analysis into their training programmes.

- Set up a specific funding line for the CPD of adult and community educators in development education or lobby DES to make CPD funding conditional on the inclusion of development education.

- Support and use members of IDEA to devise and deliver CPD training that includes the 'hot topics' which can be explored as part of development education and takes into account best practice criteria set by the Steering Group.

### 9.2.6    Devise and Disseminate Best Practice Materials and Information

Materials and information will be needed to support this work. There are already many materials available so these should not be ignored. However,

gaps should be addressed once they are identified.

- Conduct an audit of all available adult learning materials that consider development education and assess them against best practice criteria.
- Conduct an audit of available FETAC modules or awards on development education or global citizenship and propose modules or awards to fill the gaps identified, including modules focused on key development themes or priorities such as gender, poverty, HIV/AIDS, governance and so on.
- Conduct an audit of all FETAC modules to see which ones development education could fit into.
- Promote best practice materials to their relevant publics, ie LYCS *Connecting Communities* could be disseminated to the CEN and/ or CEFA, and www.developmenteducation.ie could be promoted widely to adult and community educators.
- Commission the development of materials and/ or information to address gaps.
- Consider developing a quality assurance system for development education.
- Devise and implement a promotional programme to raise awareness of development education and Irish Aid's work priorities amongst adult and community educators and to promote the funding it provides to support development education.

## 9.2.7    Include Learners

We cannot forget who adult and community education is for in this project.

- Apply for funding for and carry out research about the longitudinal impact of development education on adult learners.
- Ensure representatives on the steering committee named above consult with learners to ask them their interest in pursuing development education topics.
- Ensure a representative of learners is included on the steering committee named above
- Find champion learners and support them to visit learning settings and promote development education.

# <sub>10</sub> Citations

80/20. (2005). *Development in an Unequal World.* 80/20: Dublin.

Andreotti, V. (2006). "Soft versus critical global citizenship education," in *Policy and Practice: a Development Education Review.* Issue 3. 40-51.

AONTAS. (2004) *Community Education. AONTAS: Dublin*

AONTAS. (2005). *The Women's Community Education Quality Assurance Framework.* AONTAS: Dublin.

AONTAS. (2007). *AONTAS Strategic Plan: 2007-2010.* AONTAS: Dublin.

Bergmullar, C. (2005). "Global Education with the Third Age." In *The Development Education Journal.* 12 (1). 21-22.

Birzea et. Al. (2004) *All European Study on Policies for Education for Democratic Citizenship.* Council of Europe: www.coe.int

Bourne, J. (2003). "Towards a Theory of Development Education." In *The Development Education Journal*. 10 (30):3-6.

Bown, L. (2007). *What do we mean by development?* The Development Education Commission: UK.

Ceccini, M. (2003). *Active Citizenship, Adult Learning and Active Citizenship, Lifelong Learning and Active Citizenship.* Key Note Speech at the EAEA Conference Cyprus.

Commission of the European Communities.(2005). *Proposal for a Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council on Key Competences for Lifelong Learning.* Brussels.

Davies, L. et al.(2004). *Global Citizenship Education: the Needs of Teachers and Learners*. CIER: University of Birmingham.

DEA. (2001). *Goals for DECs.*

DEEEP, Development Education Exchange in Europe Project. (2007). *The European Consensus on Development: the Contribution of Development Education and Awareness-Raising*. DEEEP: Brussels.

Dochas. (2003). *Dochas Development Education Survey.* Dochas: Ireland.

European Association for the Education of Adults (EAEA). (2006). *Adult Education Trends and Issues.* EAEA: Brussels.

Europe-Wide Global Education Congress. (2002). *European Strategy Framework for Improving and Increasing Global Education in Europe to the year 2015.* Europe-Wide Global Education Congress: Maastricht

Faul, M. "Read my lips, it's not just the economy: Reframing Education.

*Development Education Journal.* 13(3). 9-12.

Fincham, G.(2005). "A paving of good intentions: why development education needs to engage with civil society." In *The Development Education Journal.* 12 (1)

Fitzgerald, H. (2005). *Development and Intercultural Education: Literature Review.* DICE: Dublin.

Fitzgerald, H. (2007). *Analysis of the Impact of DICE modules on Initial Teacher Education on Student Knowledge and Views of the Global Dimension in Education.* DICE: Dublin*.*

Giroux, H.A. (2004). "Neoliberalism and the Demise of Democracy: Resurrecting Hope in Dark Times." www.dissidentvoice.org.

Government of Ireland, Department of Education and Science (DES). (2008). *The Development and State of the Art of Adult Learning and Education in Ireland.* DES: Ireland.

Government of Ireland. (200X). *White Paper on Lifelong Learning.* Government Stationary Office: Dublin.

Hope, A. and S. Timmel. (1999). *Training for Transformation Handbook for Community Workers.* Training for Transformation Institute: South Africa.

Irish Aid. (2007). *Development Education Strategy Plan: promoting Public Engagement for Development.* Government Stationary Office: Dublin.

Kenny, M and S. Malley. (2002). *Development Education in Ireland: Challenges and Opportunities for the Future.* Dochas: Dublin.

McNeill, Helena. (2005). *Connecting Communities: A Practical Guide to using Development Education in Community Settings.* LYCS: Dublin.

 Lynch, K. (2004). "Equality and Education." In Baker, J. et al. (Eds). *Equality: from Theory to Action.* Palgrave Macmillan: UK.

Marshall, H. "The Global Education Terminology Debate: exploring some of the Issues." In Hayden, M et al (Eds). *Sage Handbook of Research in International Education.* Sage: UK

Maunsell, C et al. (2008). *National Report on Lifelong Learning in Ireland.* Educational Disadvantage Centre: Dublin. p 30.

Naidoo, K. (2005). *Citizenship, Education and Governance in a Global Context.* Speech for AONTAS Citizen Learner Conference.

Najmudin, R. (2004). "The Global Dimension in Neighbourhood Community Work in Britain." in *The Development Education Journal.* 10 (2).

NCCA. (2006). *A Study of the Opportunities for Development Education at Senior Cycle.* Irish Aid: Dublin.

Osler, A. (2004). "Citizenship and the Challenge of Global Education" in

Kent, A. and A. Morgan (Eds). *The Challenge of the Global Dimension in Education.* Institute of Education: UK

Osler, A. (1994). "Introduction: the Challenges of Development Education." In Council of Europe. *Development Education: Global Perspectives in the Curriculum.* Cassel:UK.

Ravazzolo, T. (1995). "Human Rights and Citizenship" in *Teaching for Citizenship in Europe.* Osler et al. (Eds.)

Robson, C. (2002). *Real World Research*.

Rost, J. "Competences for Global Learning." In *The Development Education Journal.* 11(1).

Sheehy, M. (2001). *Partners Companion to Training for Transformation.* Partners: Dublin.

Scottish Executive. (2003) *Think Global, Act Local: International Education in Communities.* The Stationary Office: Scotland.

Tanner, J. (2007). "Global Citizenship." In *Teaching the Global Dimension: Key Principles and Effective Practice*. Hicks, D. and C. Holden (Eds.) Routledge: London.

Task Force on Active Citizenship. (March 2007.) *The Concept of Active Citizenship*. Secretariat of the Taskforce: Dublin. Or Khoo, SM. (2006). "Development Education, citizenship and civic engagement at third level and beyond in the Republic of Ireland." In *Policy and Practice – a Development Education Review* Vol 1 Issue 3 Special Issue on Citizenship

The Democracy Commission. (2005). *Engaging Citizens' -The Case for Democratic Renewal in Ireland*. TASC: Dublin.

Toepfer, B. "Global Education in Adult and Vocational Education – why is it a must in the 21st Century?" in *The Development Education Journal*. 9(2). 15-17.

White, R. (2004). "Adult Education and Teilhardian Thought: contextualising Socialisation into Globalisation." In *New Horizons in Adult Education.* 18.

# 11 Appendix A
## Policies Relevant to Development Education

Policies were analysed to see how their guidelines and principles could support the integration of development education into adult and community education in line with the rationale set out in the context review, namely:

- building a range essential skills for participating in a global society, in particular of those who are most marginalised
- awareness of global impact of local decision-making
- social exclusion as global phenomenon – addressing the exclusion of the most marginalised
- essential for civil society, redistribution of power

| Policy Document | Comments |
| --- | --- |
| *White Paper on Adult Education – Learning for Life* | • four of six priority areas for lifelong learning are relevant, citizenship, consciousness-raising, cultural development and community building<br>• embraces principles of equality and interculturalism |
| *National Skills Strategy Report* | • acknowledges importance of education and training for fostering social cohesion<br>• highlights and recommends prioritisation of fostering of generic skills including, people-related skills (ie communication and interpersonal) and conceptual/thinking skills<br>• acknowledges globalising world<br>• recommends targeting low skilled and educationally disadvantaged |
| *Task Force on Active Citizenship Report* | • embraces principles of lifelong learning, diversity, inclusion, equality, solidarity and enabling and empowering decision-making<br>• recommends the expansion of education for citizenship in the adult education sectors<br>• recommends the development of a certificate/award given upon completion of three months of volunteering or community involvement<br>• recommends all community and voluntary organisations should be encouraged to engage with newcomers<br>• has targets for increasing the number of adults in civic activities and community involvement<br>• acknowledges European dimension to citizenship and 'caring about global issues' |

| Policy Document | Comments |
|---|---|
| *Irish Aid – Development Education Strategy* | • objective to explore opportunities for greater support to educators through intermediaries such as AONTAS, and<br>• also has objective to support structured education programmes in community education, prioritising the development of FETAC accredited courses.<br>• Made a commitment to strengthen coherence between development education and national and citizenship education in Ireland |
| *National Development Plan, 2007-2013* | • Has as high level objective promotion of social inclusion and integration of migrants<br>• Under social inclusion highlights importance of providing those from disadvantaged backgrounds with education necessary for employment and active participation<br>• Under Community Development Sub-Programme provides for assisting communities, particularly disadvantaged communities to identify and address challenges in their area<br>• Provides funding for groups supporting communities to have their voices heard<br>• Acknowledges role of community education in engaging with hard to reach groups |
| *Towards 2016 – Social Partnership Agreement* | • States high level outcomes of driving the lifelong learning agenda, learning opportunities for adults in vulnerable groups or who are educationally disadvantaged and further development of second chance education<br>• Vision includes people of working age who can participate fully in Irish social, economic and cultural life<br>• Vision also includes each person of working age having access to lifelong learning opportunities |
| *National Action Plan for Social Inclusion, 2007-2016* | • Restates social partnership agreement commitments above |

| Policy Document | Comments |
|---|---|
| *National Women's Strategy, 2007-2016* | • Has an action in regard to continuing to provide supports in further and adult education to programmes for hard to reach groups<br>• Contains an objective and a number of actions in relation to fostering the achievement of the UN Millennium Development Goals, including an action to increase funding to women's organisations to ensure women's needs and interests remain on the development and human rights agenda |
| *National Action Plan Against Racism* | • Sets outcome of enhanced participation of cultural and ethnic minorities in community development<br>• Also focuses on importance of organisations developing intercultural approaches through a whole system approach |
| *Local Development Social Inclusion Programme* | • Has a community development measure which supports partnership approaches to strengthening voluntary and community organisations through leadership, management, community development, information and networking |

# 12 Appendix B
## Relevant FETAC Modules[104]

| Level | Title |
|-------|-------|
| 1 | None found |
| 2 | None found |
| 3 | • "Living in a Diverse Society" (EF0169)<br>• "Transnational Experience" (WF0007) |
| 4 | • "Catering for Diversity" (D10149)<br>• "Understanding Interculturalism" (E10169)<br>• (LYCS locally-developed module) "Global Development Awareness" |
| 5 | • (Amnesty Ireland locally-developed module) "Human Rights and Collective Action" (N22726)<br>• "Intercultural Studies" (E20169)<br>• "Social Analysis" (E20157)<br>• (LYCS locally-developed module) "Global Development Practice" |
| 6 | • "Transnational Experience" (W30007) |

104    This list is not exhaustive and only includes modules that are available for download from _ and locally developed modules discovered through the research process. There are likely other locally developed modules available that explore development education and could be used in adult and community education settings.

# 13 Appendix C
## List of Interviewees

| Name/ Title | Organisation/ Agency |
| --- | --- |
| Alison Leahy – Development Education Officer | Comhlamh |
| Anne Molloy – Human Rights Education Manager | Amnesty Ireland |
| Bill Halliden – Director of Learning | ICTU |
| Blaithnead Nichinneide – Integration Officer | NALA |
| Colm Hughes – Training Services | FAS |
| David Treacy – Director Adult and Community Education | City of Dublin VEC |
| Fiona Dunne - CEF | County Galway VEC |
| Fiona Hartley – Chief Executive Officer | Wicklow VEC |
| Fiona O'Loughlin – President of the AEOA | County Galway VEC |
| Helena McNeill – Development Education | LYCS |
| Joanna McMinn - Director | NWCI |
| Johnny Sheehan – Co-ordinator Youth Development Programme | NYCI |
| Karl Quinn – Adult Basic Education | County Clare VEC |
| Lucy Deering – IDEA representative (Concern) | IDEA |
| Maeve McGarvey - CEF | County Donegal VEC |
| Margot Kelly – Basic Education Tutor | City of Dublin VEC |
| Maria Barry – Education Programme Co-ordinator | Trocaire |
| Mary McGillicuddy – Co-ordinator | KADE |
| Michael Doorly – Director Development Education | Concern |
| Mike Hook – VTOS Co-ordinator | County Clare VEC |
| Pat O'Mahony – Research Officer | IVEA |
| Patricia Curtin – Assistant Director General Corporate Policies and Standards | FAS |
| Seamus Hempenstall – Principal Officer | Further Education Section – Department of Education and Science |
| Thomas Tichelmann – Assistant Principal Officer | Development Education Section – Irish Aid |

# 14 Appendix D
## Interview Schedule

1) What do you see as the purpose of adult/community education?

2) What do you see as the purpose of development education?

3) What do you see as the purpose of active citizenship?

4) What is the shared purpose or purposes of these three practices?

5) In 2003, Peadar Cremin reflected on a survey that was conducted about the Irish public's understanding of development issues. He said, "[surveys have shown] strong public support in Ireland for the principle of helping developing countries matched by a willingness to give. What is surprising, however, is that this generosity and openness does not seem to be matched by a deep knowledge or engagement with issues of global development, justice or equality."[105] Do you think this statement is accurate? Please explain your response.

    a. (If accurate) Why do you think this situation is the case?

6) Is there a role for adult/ community education provision in facilitating adults to engage with issues of global development, justice or equality?

    a. Can you describe that role?

7) What would integrating development education into adult education mean to you in practice?

8) How could your organisation/ department support that to happen?

9) What are the other key stakeholders that would be involved in a strategy to support the integration of development education into adult/ community education?

10) What would each of those stakeholders provide (ie supports/ resources)?

    a. What would be the role of AONTAS in this strategy?

    b. What would the role of Irish Aid be?

    c. Would other structures be needed?

11) How could development education facilitate active citizenship?

    a. For instance, what skills for active citizenship can DE foster?

    b. Or how could exploring active citizenship assist adult learners to engage with issues of global development, justice or equality?

12) Should an explicit outcome of development education in adult education be active citizenship? Please explain the reasons for your response.

13) How would the strategy you have described change, if at all, if a potential outcome of DE was active citizenship?

14) How could your department/ agency ensure that any groups you fund or support include a global dimension to their activities?

---

105    Cremin, Peadar. (2003). "Deepening Public Understanding in Ireland of International Development Issues." in *The Development Education Journal.* 10 (1). p19.

# 15 Appendix E
## Survey Questionnaire

Please fill out the questionnaire below by √ the correct answer to each question. Any information you give us is confidential and will only be used for the purpose of generating statistics. Thank you very much for taking the time to answer these questions.

### Section 1:  Understanding of Development Education and Active Citizenship

**1. Which of the following would you associate with the term 'development education'? (*Please √ all that apply*)**

[   ] social justice

[   ] fair trade

[   ] critical reflection

[   ] world-wide poverty

[   ] fighting for global equality

[   ] international development priorities

[   ] learning about human rights

[   ] sustainable human development

[   ] donating to a charity such as Trocaire or Concern

[   ] governance

[   ] gender

[   ] people fighting exclusion at a local, national and/ or global level

[   ] learning process about the unequal world we live in

[   ] global issues

[   ] migration

[   ] food security

[   ] emergencies

[   ] social analysis

[   ] training

[   ] empowerment

[   ] HIV/AIDS

**2. From the above list which do you consider the top three priority features of development education?**

1. _____
2. _____
3. _____

**3. Which of the following would you associate with the term 'active citizenship'? (*Please √ all that apply*)**

[   ] exercising legally protected rights

[   ] voting in local and/or national elections

[   ] paying taxes

[   ] participating in the labour force

[   ] volunteering in or donating to a local or national non-profit organization

[   ] carrying out responsibilities as a citizen in Ireland set out by government

[   ] working through elected representatives towards shared goals

[   ] civil society

[   ] working with other citizens towards shared goals

[   ] participating in community development

[   ] fighting for the rights of others less well off locally and/or nationally

**4. From the above list which do you consider the top three priority features of active citizenship?**

1. _____
2. _____
3. _____

### Section 2: Approach to Adult Education and the Links between Development Education and Active Citizenship

***Based on your previous reflections about development education and active citizenship***

*above, please indicate (by circling) the extent to which you agree or disagree with the following statements.*

**5. It is important for my organisation to work with other organisations to achieve a civil society.**

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither | Disagree | Disagree Strongly |

**6. My organisation has a role in encouraging learners to become active citizens.**

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither | Disagree | Disagree Strongly |

**7. I see connections between the social issues tackled by my organisation here in Ireland and those tackled by similar organisations in other parts of the world.**

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither | Disagree | Disagree Strongly |

**8. Adult/community education should assist learners to become critically reflective of the society and the world they live in.**

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither | Disagree | Disagree Strongly |

**9. Practicing development education in adult/ community education should result in learners becoming active citizens at local, national or global level.**

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither | Disagree | Disagree Strongly |

**10. Participation in adult/ community education and development education can empower those who are discriminated against in Irish society.**

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Agree Strongly | Agree | Neither | Disagree | Disagree Strongly |

---

### Section 3: Mapping Development Education Provision

**11. Have you engaged in or supported the running of the following development education activities for learners? (Please √ all that apply)**

[   ] provision of development education courses

[   ] provision of development education modules within courses

[   ] provision of once-off development education sessions within courses

[   ] running stand-alone development education workshops

[   ] use materials (posters, leaflets and newspaper articles) about international human rights tools or global issues to assist learning

[   ] none of the above

**12. Do you encourage your learners to volunteer?**
[   ] Yes      [   ] No

**13. Do you encourage your learners to vote?**
[   ] Yes      [   ] No

**14. If you provide development education activities, what do you see as possible outcomes for learners? (Please √ all relevant choices)**

[   ]      Voting in local and national elections.
[   ]      Volunteering for a charity or voluntary group.
[   ]      Participating in community development activities in their community.
[   ]      Donating regularly to a development organisation like Trocaire or Concern.

[   ]    Participating in action at local, national or global level to combat poverty and social exclusion.

[   ]    Buying Fair Trade goods

[   ]    Signing petitions to support lobbying campaigns

### 15. Does your organisation organise activities for learners or support other organisations to do so in relation to the following? (Please √ all that apply)

[   ] World Aids Day

[   ] International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

[   ] United Nations Millennium Development Goals

[   ] International Women's Day

[   ] Gay Pride

[   ] Human Rights Day

[   ] World Day for the Eradication of Poverty

[   ] International Day for the Elimination of Violence against Women

[   ] 16 Days of Action against Violence against Women

[   ] World Food Day

[   ] Fair Trade Fortnight

[   ] One World Week

[   ] None of the above

[   ] Other (*please specify*) _____

### 16. Do you use the following resources in your organisation? *(Please √ all that apply)*

[   ] *Partners Companion to Training for Transformation*

[   ] *Partners Training for Transformation – Handbook for Community Workers*

[   ] *Beijing Platform for Action*

[   ] *80/20 Educating and Acting for a Better World*

[   ] Banulacht's- *A Facilitator's Guide for Economic Literacy*

[   ] *One World Week Theme Pack – National Youth Council of Ireland*

[   ] www.developmenteducation.ie

[   ] *'Connecting Communities: A Practical Guide to using Development Education in Community Settings'* by Lourdes Youth and Community Service

[   ] None of the above

[   ] Other _____

### 17. Which of the following activities does your organisation engage in? *(Please √ all that apply)*

[   ] staff/ management participation in training or seminars about development education

[   ] affiliation to a development education network

[   ] staff signing petitions to support international campaigns

[   ] organisation receives a regular newsletter or publication from a development organisation

[   ] staff attending conferences about global issues

[   ] none of the above

---

**Section 4: Supports and Challenges to Integrating Development Education into Adult Education Provision**

---

### 18. What do you think are the challenges to integrating development education into your adult education provision? *(Please √ all that apply)*

[   ] It is too complicated or complex.

[   ] It is not relevant to my work.

[   ] Lack of teaching materials and information.

[   ] I cannot make a difference to the world we live in through my work.

[   ] Learners would not be interested.

[   ] I do not feel that it is relevant to the education the organisation provides.

[   ] Lack of support for integration of development education at the management level of the organisation.

[   ] The funding programmes for our work do not allow integration of development education into the work

[ ] Other *(please specify)* _____

**19. What kind of supports would assist you to integrate development education into your adult/ community education provision?** *(Please √ all that apply)*

[   ] Training in development education topics and methodologies
[   ] More teaching materials and information made easily accessible to me.
[ ] An organisational commitment to integrating development education into what    the organisation provides.
[ ] Management guidance and support to integrate development education into our work.
[   ] More funding for development education activities

---

<center>Section 5: **Demographics**</center>

**20. Please fill in the information requested in the table below:**

| | |
|---|---|
| **Job Title** | |
| **Name of Organisation** | |
| **Location of organisation ( county)** | |
| **Number of courses or modules run or supported per year?** | |
| **Number of adult learner participants per year?** | |

**21. Are you in receipt of funding for development education activities?**
[   ] Yes       [   ] No

**If yes, please indicate the funding programme.**
_____


**22. As part of this research we are looking for case studies of organisations that have made connections between development education and active citizenship in their activities. If you think your organisation would be eligible to take part in a case study for this research please leave your name and contact details in the space below and we will contact you for further information.**
_____

~~The questionnaire is now over. Thank you for your participation.~~
**If you need any additional information about this study, please feel free to contact Natasha**

**Bailey at 01 406 8220.**

## 16 Appendix F
### Focus Group Processes

| STEP | Time Allotted |
|---|---|
| • As participants come into the room they will be given post-its and asked to post words, phrases, methods or topics that come to mind when they think of 'active citizenship' or 'development education' (one response per post-it) They will then be asked to put their responses on the flipchart sheets with the named concepts as headings that will be posted on the wall.[3] | |
| • Welcome and introduce research project and aims and objectives of the session. | **5 minutes** |
| • Ask each person to introduce themselves and say their reasons/ motivations for attending the focus group today and do they think the Irish Aid statement and the aim of the research are worthwhile. | **15 minutes** |
| • Place four flipchart sheets taped together on the floor with two concentric circles inside a large circle. The large circle is labelled 'adult/ community education.' The two other circles are 1) active citizenship and 2) development education. Ask the group to tour the results of the exercise they participated in when they came in the room. Once they have done that ask them to answer this question: *From your own experience, what are the words, phrases, methods and/or topics that overlap adult/ community education, development education and active citizenship? (In other words, what does learning look like that involves these three practices, or what do groups do if they are bringing together these three things)* As group responds ask prompting questions: *How does this overlap?* *Can you explain your choice?* <br>• Write the responses on cards (one response per card) and check that there is consensus in the group for each response. | **20 minutes** |

| STEP | Time Allotted |
|---|---|
| • Now say to the group (point out that this is a scenario):<br>*If the goal is to integrate development education into adult/ community education in order to build the skills of learners to be active citizens, then what strategy would ensure that this goal is reached.[4]*<br>Point out to the group that you are going to lead them through a mapping exercise that will help us to create a visual representation of this strategy. | |
| • Lay out the stakeholder cards on the floor in a vertical row to the side of the centre of the working area. Ask the group this question:<br>*From your own perspective and workplace, what actions or supports would need to be achieved at the local, regional and/or national level for this integration to take place?*<br>• As participants shout out their answers ask them to clarify their reasons for doing so and check that the rest of the group agrees with each choice. Write each action on a card and put it in one of three rows (national, regional or local) in the centre of the work area – writing on a card underneath each one the rationale for selection. | **20 minutes** |
| • Ask the group:<br>*Which organisation or person would be responsible for carrying out these actions?*<br>Point to each action and ask this question in relation to each one. As participants come up with stakeholder begin to group action cards underneath the relevant stakeholder. | **20 minutes** |
| • BREAK (invite participants to go to flipcharts on the wall to write in any experience they have had delivering or participating in development education) | **10 minutes** |
| • Taking each stakeholder in turn, ask:<br>*Is there anything else that this agency/ person could do to support the integration of development education and active citizenship into adult/ community education?*<br>• As responses are named write them on cards and place them under the stakeholder card. Also check to see if there are any stakeholders missing that need to be added in at this stage. | **20 minutes** |

| STEP | Time Allotted |
|------|---------------|
| • Now put the following three questions on a flipchart: *Do we need to define roles for some of these stakeholders? For instance does there need to be a co-ordinating role?* *Does anything need to happen between the stakeholders in order to make this strategy work, i.e reporting or resource exchange?* *Looking at this map are there any other structures or roles that would be required to support adult/ community educators to integrate development education in order to help learners build the skills to become active citizens?*<br>• As participants answer these questions also urge them to place stakeholder cards where they should sit in relation to other stakeholders based on the role.<br>• As participants elaborate on interactions between stakeholders write that out on longer pieces of paper and place them between the stakeholder cards. | **30 minutes** |
| • Thank the group for their hard work and say that this section of the focus group is over but that there is one more question. Divide the group into small groups or pairs and ask them to note their answers to this question on flipchart sheets:<br>*In a survey we did for this research providers said that they needed more information and training to assist them to integrate development education into what they do. Can you say what the content and form of those resources would be?* | **15 minutes** |
| • Thank-you and close inviting participants to evaluate on the way out. Point out that they will receive a copy of the notes from the meeting for their own use. | |

**The focus group of learners were asked:**

1) What were the benefits of exploring development education in your group?
2) How did the development education activities impact on your life?
3) What was the link for you between the development education and the voter education projects?

# 17 Appendix G
## Case Study Criteria and Questions

## 17.1    Criteria for Case Studies

1) Was a clear connection made between the development education content (or global nature of the topic that was the focus of the learning) and active citizenship (or were there discussions about how this learning could lead to participants or a participant taking action in their community, nationally or internationally)?
2) Was the concept of active citizenship explored as global citizenship (it that it was not confined to local or national action or legal citizenship of the nation state)
3) Were a number of different forms of active citizenship presented as possible outcomes for learners?
4) How did participation in the activities result in learners becoming active citizens?
5) Did the course seek to foster the following skills: research, debate, critical thinking…
6) Were there measurable and/or documented impacts on learners (ie an evaluation report or project report)?
7) Did the activities start where learners are at: ie that it responded to their issues and learning needs?
8) Was a whole organisation approach taken, ie was there an organisational commitment to the activities, is it an explicit organisational policy to engage in development education and foster active citizenship?

## 17.2    Case Study Questions

1) What were the aim and objectives of the programme or learning activities?
2) Briefly, can you give me a narrative of the course/programme as it actually happened, in particular the process and the methodologies employed?
3) Or, how did you go about developing the programme/ course?
4) What were the stated outcomes for the course/programme?
5) How did you link the development education content and active citizenship?
6) How did you get the learners to consider themselves as global citizens?
7) What kinds of actions were presented to the group (or devised by them) as forms of active citizenship?
8) How did participation in the activities result in learners becoming active citizens?
9) What skills do you think the activities enabled the learners to learn and practice?

10)Were the planned outcomes met? If no, can you say a little bit about what blocked achievement of the outcomes?

11)What were the unplanned outcomes for participants that came about as a result of the learning activities?

12)How did/ does your organisation support the type of learning activities that you have described through the questions answered here?

# 18 Appendix H
## Detailed Profile of Web-based Survey Respondents

### Respondents role in their organisation

| | |
|---|---|
| Worker | 15.5% |
| Manager | 23.5% |
| **Co-ordinator** | **40.8%** |
| Volunteer | 3.3% |
| Board of management | 2.8% |
| Other | 14.1% |

Other roles specified by respondents who took part in the survey were principals and tutors.

### Type of organisation

| | |
|---|---|
| Development education organisation | 2.3% |
| Youth organisation | 0.9% |
| Community development project | 16.0% |
| Family resource centre | 8.9% |
| Men's organisation | 0.5% |
| Women's organisation | 5.6% |
| Community education organisation | 6.1% |
| Travellers training centre | 0.9% |
| **VEC** | **23.0%** |
| Youthreach | 0.0% |
| BTEI co-ordinator | 0.9% |
| Adult education centre | 8.5% |
| Adult education/outreach department- third level | 2.3% |
| Community/area based partnership | 5.6% |
| Other | 18.3% |

Other types of organisations who took part in this survey included a probation service, a mental health day centre and a local employment service.

## Location of organisations

| | |
|---|---|
| **Dublin** | **30.5%** |
| Wicklow | 3.8% |
| Wexford | 3.3% |
| Carlow | 1.9% |
| Kildare | 1.9% |
| Meath | 1.4% |
| Louth | 1.4% |
| Monaghan | 0.5% |
| Cavan | 1.4% |
| Longford | 0.9% |
| Westmeath | 0.5% |
| Offaly | 1.9% |
| Laois | 1.9% |
| Kilkenny | 0.9% |
| Waterford | 4.2% |
| Cork | 10.3% |
| Kerry | 5.2% |
| Limerick | 4.7% |
| Tipperary | 1.4% |
| Clare | 3.8% |
| Antrim | 1.4% |
| Armagh | 0.5% |
| Down | 0.0% |
| Fermanagh | 0.0% |
| Derry | 0.0% |
| Tyrone | 0.0% |
| Galway | 4.2% |
| Mayo | 4.2% |
| Roscommon | 0.9% |
| Sligo | 2.8% |
| Leitrim | 0.9% |
| Donegal | 3.3% |

## 18.1 In Receipt of Funding for Development Education

22.1% (n=47) of respondents say they are in receipt of funding for development education activities. 77.9% (n=166) of respondents say they are not in receipt of funding for development education activities.

## 18.2 Funding Programmes for those in Receipt of Funding

Thirty-three organisations specified the funding programme for their development education activities. Of these, 13 organisations receive funding from Irish Aid. Two receive funding from the Department of Community, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs. Three receive funding from DES. Two receive funding from LDSIP.

## 18.3 Receipt of funding by type of organisation

- One hundred per cent (n=5) of the respondents from development education organisations said they were receiving funding for development education activities.

- 50% (n=1) of youth organisations said they were receiving funding for development education activities.

- 79.4% (n=27) of respondents from community development projects said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 20.6% (n=7) said they were in receipt of funding.

- 89.5% (n=17) of respondents from family resource centres said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 10.5% (n=2) said they were in receipt of funding.

- None (n=1) of the men's organisations receive funding for development education activities.

- 66.7% (n=8) of respondents from women's organisations said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 33.3% (n=4) said they were in receipt of funding.

- 69.2% (n=9) of respondents from community education organisations said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 30.8% (n=4) said they were in receipt of funding.

- 50% (n=1) of travellers training centres said they were receiving funding for development education activities.

- 83.7% (n=41) of respondents from VEC's said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 16.3% (n=8) said they were in receipt of funding.

- One hundred per cent (n=2) of the BTEI co-ordinators said they were receiving funding for development education activities.

- 88.9% (n=16) of respondents from adult education centres said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 11.1% (n=2) said they were in receipt of funding.

- 80% (n=4) of respondents from adult education/outreach department-

third level said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 20% (n=1) said they were in receipt of funding.

- 58.3% (n=7) of respondents from community/area based partnerships said they were not receiving any funding for development education activities, while 41.7% (n=5) said they were in receipt of funding.

# 19 Appendix I

## Qualifications/ Certification for Adult and Community Education in Ireland

| Provider | Programme |
|---|---|
| Waterford Institute of Technology | • B.A. (Hons) In Adult Education<br>• B.A. (Hons) In Community Education & Community Development<br>• B.A. (Ordinary) In Adult Education<br>• B.A. (Ordinary) In Community Education & Community Development<br>• Higher Certificate In Arts In Adult Education<br>• Higher Certificate in Arts in Literacy Development |
| Dublin City University, NUI | • B.Sc. in Education and Training (Bachelor Honours Degree) - Part-Time<br>• DC235 - BSc in Education and Training<br>• Grad Diploma/MSc in Education and Training Management(PAC Codes: DC900 ,DC901, DC902 and DC903)<br>• Graduate Diploma in Education : (PAC Code: DC905) |
| Maynooth University, NUI | • Certificate in Adult and Community Education<br>• Certificate in Training and Continuing Education<br>• Postgraduate Diploma in Adult and Community Education<br>• MLitt and PhD in Adult and Community Education |
| Queen's University, Belfast | • MSc Management of Lifelong Learning |

FETAC Level 5 and 6 – Relevant Modules

• FETAC Level 6 –E30161 – Group Work Theory and Practice; E30179 – Train the Trainer
• FETAC Level 5 - E20143, Working with Groups

# Footnotes

1        for further consideration of debates in regard to terminology see Marshall, H. "The Global Education Terminology Debate: exploring some of the Issues." In Hayden, M et al (Eds). *Sage Handbook of Research in International Education.* Sage: UK

2        Included in this category are the larger development NGOs like Trocaire or Concern who do provide some funding for development education.

3        Alternatively, the top scoring priority features of both active citizenship and development education from the survey could be presented and the group asked to consider those as they do the first exercise in the mapping.

4        If necessary, participants will be given a prompt that poses this in a more practical way, ie "Say by next September you had to make sure that every course you supported or facilitated had to have a global dimension that aimed to help learners build the skills to become active citizens, what would need to happen to enable you to do this."